

Bibliographic analysis of papers and authors published in *Tobacco Control* 1998–September 2011

Simon Chapman,¹ Gemma Derrick²

¹School of Public Health, University of Sydney, Sydney, New South Wales, Australia

²Instituto de Políticas y Bienes Públicos, Centro de Ciencias Humanas y Sociales, Consejo Superior Investigaciones Científicas, Madrid, Spain

Correspondence to

Professor Simon Chapman, University of Sydney, School of Public Health, Edward Ford Building A27, Sydney, NSW 2006, Australia; simon.chapman@sydney.edu.au

Received 4 August 2011

Accepted 26 October 2011

ABSTRACT

In the present work, the top 20 cited papers published in *Tobacco Control* between 1998 and 15 September 2011, the top 10 cited papers published after 2008 and the 50 authors whose papers have been most cited in the journal are reported. US authors dominated the most cited papers and the most cited authors, with Australian authors in second place. Papers on youth and secondhand smoke dominated the top 20 papers, although harm reduction and packaging papers appeared in the post 2008 leading cited papers.

Tobacco Control has been published since 1992, and was first indexed by the *Web of Science* from the (northern hemisphere) autumn edition in 1998 (ie, issue 3). As of 1 August 2011, 2147 articles of all types (including news items) have been published and cited 19 417 times. The journal's current (2010) impact factor (IF) is 3.077, and its 5 year IF is 4.378. In the Public, Environmental and Occupational Health category, the journal ranks 25th out of 140 journals for its current IF and 12th for its 5 year IF. This compares to *Nicotine & Tobacco Research* (29th with 2.801 and 31st at 5 years with 3.103) and *Addiction* (second in the much smaller Substance Abuse category with 4.145 and first at 5 years with 5.001). On *Tobacco Control*'s 5 year IF, the journal is the leading 'single issue' public health journal (all with IFs above *Tobacco Control* are broad epidemiology and public health journals attracting readerships and authors from diverse branches of public health). *Tobacco Control* is just two ranks below the *American Journal of Public Health*, and ahead of many renowned journals such as *Social Science and Medicine* (3.484), *Preventive Medicine* (3.520) and *Cancer Causes and Control* (3.311).

Here, we report on the top 20 cited papers and top 50 authors whose work has been most cited in the journal in the 1998 to September 2011 period.

METHODS

On 15 September 2011 the Institute of Scientific Information's *Web of Science* was searched for all publications published in *Tobacco Control*. Results returned were sorted by citation volume and the top 20 cited papers for the full period extracted (table 1), as well as the 10 most cited papers published after 2008 (to show the leading recently published papers). These were categorised by type of paper (narrative or systematic review or meta-analysis; original article), principal focus of content and country where the first author was resident for all or most of their research published in the

journal. We then examined the distribution of citations from zero through to the highest band of citation (table 2).

All authors who had published in the journal since the date of indexing (1999) were also then ranked by total number of citations to all the publications in the journal, regardless of type. Their total number of publications in *Tobacco Control*, citations per paper and their *Tobacco Control* H index were calculated (table 3). The H index¹ is a measure of citation volume over time whereby an H index of 10 means that an author has 10 publications that have been each cited at least 10 times; an H index of 15, 15 papers cited at least 15 times and so on. As such, when applied to authorship within a journal over time, it captures those authors whose work has collectively been most cited across a range of papers in that journal.

RESULTS

Table 1 shows the top 20 cited papers published since 1998 and the leading 10 most cited papers published after 2008. The categories with the most papers in the top 20 were youth (7), secondhand smoke (6), cessation (3) and industry document research (2). There were 7 review articles and 13 original articles. As with nearly all fields of scholarship, US first authors dominated the top 20 papers, with 13 papers. Of the top 20 first authors, 7 were women. Unlike the overall period, 4 out of 10 of the most cited recently published papers concerned harm reduction, and 2 concerned packaging.

More than one-third of all articles published since 1998 have never been cited, and just over 74% have been cited <10 times. Many of the uncited papers were short news analysis items. Only 1 in 165 papers has been cited 100 or more times, and only 1 in 29 has received 50 or more cites.

Authors

Table 3 shows the top 50 authors, ranked by total citations of their post 1998 papers in *Tobacco Control*. The Cancer Council Victoria's Ron Borland received the most citations, and the highest H score, but 21 of the 50 authors had higher cites per article than Borland. A total of 14 of the top 50 authors and 9 of the top 10 had a *Tobacco Control* H index score of 10 or more, arguably the best measure of consistently well cited articles across time. The most published author (S Chapman, the deputy editor and editor for much of the indexed period) had 90 articles, but the lowest citations per article in the top 50, reflecting many editorials and news analysis pieces among his publications, which are typically poorly cited. As with the top cited

Table 1 Top 20 cited papers, *Tobacco Control* autumn 1998–June 2011 and top 10 cited papers 2008–present

Papers	Citations	Type	Focus
Top 20 cited papers, 1998–present:			
1. Tyas SL, Pederson LL. Psychosocial factors related to adolescent smoking: a critical review of the literature. <i>Tob Control</i> 1998;7:409–20. (Canada)	293	R	Youth
2. DiFranza JR, Rigotti NA, McNeill AD, <i>et al.</i> Initial symptoms of nicotine dependence in adolescents. <i>Tob Control</i> 2000;9:313–19. (USA)	216	OA	Youth/addiction
3. DiFranza JR, Savageau JA, Rigotti NA, <i>et al.</i> Development of symptoms of tobacco dependence in youth: 30 month follow-up data from the DANDY study. <i>Tob Control</i> 2002;11:228–35. (USA)	177	OA	Youth/addiction
4. Lantz PM, Jacobson PD, Warner KE, <i>et al.</i> Investing in youth tobacco control: a review of smoking prevention and control strategies. <i>Tob Control</i> 2000;9:47–63. (USA)	164	R	Youth
5. Malone RE, Balbach ED. Tobacco industry documents: treasure trove or quagmire? <i>Tob Control</i> 2000;9:334–8. (USA)	158	OA	Documents
6. Yach D, Warren CW, Silva VLD, <i>et al.</i> Tobacco use among youth: a cross country comparison. <i>Tob Control</i> 2002;11:252–70. (Switzerland-WHO)	138	OA	Youth
7. Farkas AJ, Gilpin EA, Distefan JM, <i>et al.</i> The effects of household and workplace smoking restrictions on quitting behaviours. <i>Tob Control</i> 1999;8:261–5. (USA)	136	OA	SHS/cessation
8. Foulds J, Ramstrom L, Burke M, <i>et al.</i> Effect of smokeless tobacco (snus) on smoking and public health in Sweden. <i>Tob Control</i> 2003;12:349–59. (USA)	135	R	Harm reduction
9. Scollo M, Lal A, Hyland A, <i>et al.</i> Review of the quality of studies on the economic effects of smoke-free policies on the hospitality industry. <i>Tob Control</i> 2003;12:13–20. (Australia)	113	R	SHS
10. Fong GT, Hyland A, Borland R, <i>et al.</i> Reductions in tobacco smoke pollution and increases in support for smoke-free public places following the implementation of comprehensive smoke-free workplace legislation in the Republic of Ireland: findings from the ITC Ireland/UK Survey. <i>Tob Control</i> 2006;15:51–8. (Suppl 3) (Canada)	113	OA	SHS
11. Wakefield M, Chaloupka F. Effectiveness of comprehensive tobacco control programmes in reducing teenage smoking in the USA. <i>Tob Control</i> 2000;9:177–86. (Australia)	108	R	Youth
12. Farrelly MC, Evans WN, Stekas AES. The impact of workplace smoking bans: results from a national survey. <i>Tob Control</i> 1999;8:272–7. (USA)	108	OA	SHS
13. Bonita R, Duncan J, Truelsen T, <i>et al.</i> Passive smoking as well as active smoking increases the risk of acute stroke. <i>Tob Control</i> 1999;8:156–60. (Switzerland-WHO)	105	OA	Epidemiology
14. Hughes JR, Shiffman S, Callas P, <i>et al.</i> A meta-analysis of the efficacy of over-the-counter, nicotine replacement. <i>Tob Control</i> 2003;12:21–7. (USA)	100	R	Cessation
15. Maziak W, Ward KD, Soweid RAA, <i>et al.</i> Tobacco smoking using a waterpipe: a re-emerging strain in a global epidemic. <i>Tob Control</i> 2004;13:327–33. (USA)	99	R	Waterpipes
16. Osler M, Prescott E. Psychosocial, behavioural, and health determinants of successful smoking cessation: a longitudinal study of Danish adults. <i>Tob Control</i> 1998;7:262–7. (Denmark)	92	OA	Cessation
17. Sly DF, Heald GR, Ray S. The Florida “truth” anti-tobacco media evaluation: design, first year results, and implications for planning future state media evaluations. <i>Tob Control</i> 2001;10:9–15. (USA)	89	OA	Media
18. Matt GE, Quintana PJE, Hovell MF, <i>et al.</i> Households contaminated by environmental tobacco smoke: sources of infant exposures. <i>Tob Control</i> 2004;13:29–37. (USA)	85	OA	SHS
19. Dearlove JV, Bialous SA, Glantz SA. Tobacco industry manipulation of the hospitality industry to maintain smoking in public places. <i>Tob Control</i> 2002;11:94–104. (USA)	85	OA	Documents/SHS
20. Moore L, Roberts C, Tudor-Smith C. School smoking policies and smoking prevalence among adolescents: multilevel analysis of cross-sectional data from Wales. <i>Tob Control</i> 2001;10:117–23. (UK)	85	OA	Youth
Top 10 cited papers published since 2008:			
1. Chapman S, Freeman B. Markers of the denormalisation of smoking and the tobacco industry. <i>Tob Control</i> 2008;17:25–31. (Australia)	40	OA	Social norms
2. Hyland A, Travers M J, Dresler C, <i>et al.</i> A 32-country comparison of tobacco smoke derived particle levels in indoor public places. <i>Tob Control</i> 2008;17:159–65. (USA)	36	OA	SHS
3. Kotz D, West R. Explaining the social gradient in smoking cessation: it's not in the trying, but in the succeeding. <i>Tob Control</i> 2009;18:43–6. (UK)	26	OA	Cessation
4. Carpenter CM, Connolly GN, Ayo-Yusuf OA, <i>et al.</i> Developing smokeless tobacco products for smokers: an examination of tobacco industry documents. <i>Tob Control</i> 2009;18:54–9. (USA)	22	OA	Harm reduction/documents
5. Edwards R, Thomson G, Wilson N, <i>et al.</i> After the smoke has cleared: evaluation of the impact of a new national smoke-free law in New Zealand. <i>Tob Control</i> 2008;17:e2. doi:10.1136/tc.2007.020347. (New Zealand)	20	OA	SHS
6. Borland R, Wilson N, Fong GT, <i>et al.</i> Impact of graphic and text warnings on cigarette packs: findings from four countries over 5 years. <i>Tob Control</i> 2009;18:358–64. (Australia)	20	OA	Packaging
7. Zhu SH, Wang JB, Hartman A, <i>et al.</i> Quitting cigarettes completely or switching to smokeless tobacco: do US data replicate the Swedish results? <i>Tob Control</i> 2009;18:82–7. (USA)	19	OA	Harm reduction
8. Zeller M, Hatsukami D, <i>et al.</i> The Strategic Dialogue on Tobacco harm reduction: a vision and blueprint for action in the US. <i>Tob Control</i> 2009;18:324–32. (USA)	17	Special communication	Harm reduction
9. Alpert HR, Koh H, Connolly GN. Free nicotine content and strategic marketing of moist snuff tobacco products in the United States: 2000–2006. <i>Tob Control</i> 2008;17:332–8. (USA)	15	OA	Harm reduction
10. Wakefield MA, Germain D, Durkin SJ. How does increasingly plainer cigarette packaging influence adult smokers' perceptions about brand image? An experimental study. <i>Tob Control</i> 2008;17:416–21. (Australia)	15	OA	Packaging

R, review; OA, original article; SHS, secondhand smoke.

Table 2 Citation volumes for 2147 articles published fall 1998–15 September 2011 (percentages)

TABLE 2. Citation frequency for 2017 studies published Jan 1999 to September 2017 (percentages)							
	No. of citations						
	0	1–9	10–19	20–49	50–99	100–199	200+
No. of papers	823 (38.3)	771 (35.9)	246 (11.5)	234 (10.9)	60 (2.6)	11 (0.5)	2 (0.09)

articles, the top 50 authors were dominated by US authors (32), followed by Australia (9), UK (6) and Canada (3). While *Tobacco Control* strives to be a truly international journal, none of the top

50 authors were from non-Anglophone nations, Latin America, Africa or Asia.

Table 3 Top 50 authors ranked by total citations for articles in *Tobacco Control*, 1 August 2011

Author	Articles	Citations	Citations per article	H index of <i>Tobacco Control</i> articles
1. Borland, R (Australia)	38	964	25.37	17
2. McNeill, A (UK)	23	953	41.43	14
3. Cummings, KM (USA)	44	912	20.73	16
4. Glantz, S (USA)	66	893	13.53	15
5. Hyland, A (USA)	28	861	30.75	12
6. Fong, GT (Canada)	36	847	23.53	14
7. Difranza, JR (USA)	14	635	45.36	10
8. Chapman, S (Australia)	90	599	6.66	13
9. Hammond, D (Canada)	24	586	24.42	12
10. Rigotti, NA (USA)	14	511	36.50	7
11. Wakefield, MA (Aust)	28	476	17.00	14
12. Savageau, JA (USA)	4	454	113.50	4
13. Coleman, M (USA)	3	446	148.67	3
14. Hastings, G (UK)	15	435	29.00	9
15. Ockene, J (USA)	3	407	135.67	3
16. Pierce, JP (USA)	16	413	25.81	10
17. Gilpin, EA (USA)	14	412	29.43	10
18. Connolly, G (USA)	39	389	9.97	12
19. Pederson, L (USA)	5	357	71.40	4
20. Malone, RE (USA)	28	354	12.64	10
21. Balbach, ED (USA)	9	345	38.33	7
22. Hughes, JR (USA)	14	337	24.07	9
23. Siahpush, M (Australia)*	13	325	25.00	8
24. Warner, KE (USA)	8	323	40.38	5
25. Yach, D (Switzerland)	7	318	45.71	5
26. West, R (UK)	18	302	16.78	9
27. Chaloupka, FJ (USA)	13	300	23.08	8
28. Tyas, SL (USA)	1	293	293.00	1
29. Yong, HH (Australia)	13	281	21.62	7
30. Henningfield, JE (USA)	17	277	16.29	8
31. Farrelly, MC (USA)	13	274	21.08	7
32. Hovell, MF (USA)	9	248	27.56	6
33. Hill, D (Australia)	9	247	27.44	8
34. Shiffman, S (USA)	9	244	27.11	7
35. Giovino, GA (USA)	13	243	18.90	6
36. Anderson, S (UK)	5	242	48.40	4
37. Siegel, M (USA)	14	234	16.71	9
38. McKee, M (UK)	11	232	21.09	8
39. Bialous, SA (USA)	15	226	15.07	7
40. St Cyr, D (USA)	1	216	216.00	1
41. Lantz, PM (USA)	3	198	66.00	3
42. Scollo, M (Australia)	9	192	21.33	5
43. Ling, PM (USA)	16	190	11.88	9
44. Kozlowski, LT (USA)	16	187	11.69	8
45. Carter, SM (Australia)	14	187	13.36	9
46. O'Connor, RJ (USA)	26	181	6.96	7
47. Gray, N (Australia)	12	179	14.92	7
48. Levy, DT (USA)	14	178	12.71	8
49. Benowitz, NL (USA)	8	171	21.38	5
50. Gilmore, A (UK)	20	166	8.33	8

*Moved to USA in 2007.

DISCUSSION

Citation is a measure of scientific impact within the research community and *Tobacco Control* has achieved and maintained a pleasing IF relative to its main competitors. Review articles are well known to attract citations, so there is little surprise that 7 of the top 20 cited papers were reviews. In 2006, the International Tobacco Control Policy Evaluation Project (ITC) published its first papers in *Tobacco Control*. A total of 28 have since been published in the journal, including papers in 2 supplements. These have been cited 719 times, with an average of 25.68 per paper and an H of 13. While only 1 ITC paper is in the top 20 all-time cited papers, there are 6 ITC papers (12%) in the top 50, suggesting that with time more ITC papers may move into the top 20 because they are relatively recent. In all, 6 of the top 10 cited authors are researchers who are heavily (although not exclusively) engaged in the ITC project.

In our list of leading 50 authors in *Tobacco Control* as measured by citation volume of their *Tobacco Control* papers, there are 6 outlying authors with citations per paper higher than 50 (71.4–293). All of these authors had published <4 papers with *Tobacco Control*, with all having *Tobacco Control* H indexes of <4 and owe their position in the top 50 to a single or a few heavily cited papers.

Tobacco Control has always been a journal committed to publishing research, analysis and commentary that will be strategically useful to policy advocates and practitioners, in addition to generating interest among other researchers. While we are always delighted when a paper attracts healthy citations, we are also happy to publish papers that we judge as being likely to be of clear strategic importance in advancing public and political debates. This may not necessarily translate into high scholarly interest, although there is a strong association between news media interest, paper downloads from the journal website and subsequent citations.² Our Ad Watch, Industry Watch and Advocacy in Action sections are good examples of sections of the journal that we believe have wide appeal to practitioners. However, we have published many influential research papers over the years that have often provided critical information that has been useful to policy debates. The top 20 cited papers contain several of these, such as Scollo *et al*'s review of the quality of research on the impact of smoke-free venue policies on the hospitality industry³ and Dearlove *et al*'s examination of tobacco industry efforts to manipulate the hospitality industry.⁴ Such papers can be far more influential than merely being cited by other researchers: their findings can enter into public and political discourse and become the taken-for-granted understanding of an issue. There is a small recent literature examining the associations and differences between traditional bibliographic measures of research impact and peer-assessed measures of wider, social impact of research in public health^{5 6} but no easy or reliable way of quantifying different levels of social and legislative impact on tobacco control.

Funding This study was supported by NHMRC grant 570870.

Competing interests None.

Provenance and peer review Commissioned; externally peer reviewed.

REFERENCES

1. **Hirsch JE**. An index to quantify an individual's scientific research output. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 2005;**102**:16569–72.
2. **Chapman S**, Nguyen TN, White C. Press released papers are more downloaded and cited. *Tob Control* 2007;**16**:71.
3. **Scollo M**, Lal A, Hyland A, *et al*. Review of the quality of studies on the economic effects of smoke-free policies on the hospitality industry. *Tob Control* 2003;**12**:13–20.
4. **Dearlove JV**, Bialous SA, Glantz S. Tobacco industry manipulation of the hospitality industry to maintain smoking in public places. *Tob Control* 2002;**11**:94–104.
5. **Derrick GE**, Haynes AS, Chapman S, *et al*. The association between four citation metrics and peer rankings of research influence of Australian researchers in six fields of public health. *PLoS One* 2011;**6**:e18521.
6. **Haynes AS**, Derrick GE, Chapman S, *et al*. From 'our world' to the 'real world': exploring the behavior of policy influential Australian public health researchers. *Soc Sci Med* 2011;**72**:1047–55.

Invited commentary

The smoking epidemic started in the Western world and later spread to low- and middle-income countries. Accordingly, it is not surprising that most researchers and papers published in *Tobacco Control* from 1998 to September 2011 were from high-income countries. The prevalence of smoking is increasing in low- and middle-income countries while it is declining in high-income nations.¹ This publication trend may change in the future. A few words of caution about interpreting the results of this paper: there is no information about rejected papers. Keeping in view the acceptance rate of 22% in 2009, this information is contextually important. An online search of PubMed limiting years (1998–September 2011) and using the combined words 'smoking and tobacco' retrieved 103 863 articles spread across 5194 pages, so the papers published in *Tobacco Control* are not representative of all researchers and papers published in inter-

national journals worldwide, including the Eastern world. However, the papers published in *Tobacco Control* have been useful for worldwide policy initiatives, resulting in tremendous benefits to smokers and non-smokers.

Abdullah M Al-Bedah, Naseem Akhtar Qureshi

Arabian Center for Tobacco Control, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia

Correspondence to Dr Abdullah M Al-Bedah, Arabian Center for Tobacco Control, PO Box 25152, Riyadh-11466 Saudi Arabia; aalbedah33@yahoo.com

Competing interests None.

Provenance and peer review Commissioned; internally peer reviewed.

Tobacco Control 2012;**21**:201. doi:10.1136/tobaccocontrol-2012-050432

REFERENCE

1. **Al-Bedah AM**, Qureshi NA. The Global Youth Tobacco Survey: 2001–2002 in Riyadh region, the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia. *J Substance Abuse Rehabil* 2011;**2**:197–205.