



OPEN ACCESS

# Five years of discourse related to Indonesia tobacco control reform: a content analysis of online media coverage

Beladenta Amalia <sup>1,2</sup> Putu Ayu Swandewi Astuti <sup>3</sup> Joanna E Cohen <sup>1</sup>

► Additional supplemental material is published online only. To view, please visit the journal online (<https://doi.org/10.1136/tc-2024-058661>).

<sup>1</sup>Institute for Global Tobacco Control, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, Maryland, USA

<sup>2</sup>Center for Indonesia's Strategic Development Initiatives (CISDI), Jakarta Pusat, Jakarta, Indonesia

<sup>3</sup>Public Health and Preventive Medicine, Udayana University Faculty of Medicine, Denpasar, Bali, Indonesia

## Correspondence to

Dr Beladenta Amalia, Institute for Global Tobacco Control, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, Maryland, USA; [beladenta24@gmail.com](mailto:beladenta24@gmail.com)

Received 20 February 2024

Accepted 5 August 2024



© Author(s) (or their employer(s)) 2024. Re-use permitted under CC BY-NC. No commercial re-use. See rights and permissions. Published by BMJ.

**To cite:** Amalia B, Astuti PAS, Cohen JE. *Tob Control* Epub ahead of print: [please include Day Month Year]. doi:10.1136/tc-2024-058661

## ABSTRACT

**Background** In 2017, Indonesia initiated the amendment of its 11-year-old tobacco control regulation (PP 109/2012) to reduce smoking among youth, but the process was stalled. The proposed changes in the regulation include a full ban on tobacco advertising, promotion and sponsorship (TAPS), increasing health warning label (HWL) size and regulating electronic cigarettes (e-cigarettes). This study analysed the arguments and actors for and against the PP 109/2012 amendment in online media articles.

**Method** Content analysis of 326 online articles reporting on the PP 109/2012 amendment published from 2018 to 2023, retrieved from the Tobacco Watcher platform. We coded articles for statements supporting or opposing the amendment (position statement), content of the arguments used to support (supporting argument) and oppose (opposing argument) the amendment, actors presenting the arguments and tobacco control measures. We iteratively reviewed and coded data and presented the frequency of categories.

**Results** Of 332 position statements, 53.3% were against the amendment. The main categories of supporting arguments (N=1448) included smoking trends (21.1%), health implications (16.6%), science-based evidence (9.6%) and protecting the population (9.2%). Opposing arguments (N=1413) emphasised the tobacco farmers' welfare (16.6%), impact on the industry (16.4%) and current regulation is sufficient (11.0%). Supporting actors were predominantly health-related entities and government officials (89.3%), while 62.1% of opposing actors included trade and Islamic groups, the tobacco industry and front groups. HWLs, e-cigarette/heated tobacco product regulation and TAPS were the main (77.8%) tobacco control measures mentioned in the proamendment arguments, while HWLs, TAPS and cigarette sale restrictions were the dominant (79.3%) tobacco control measures in anti-amendment arguments.

**Conclusion** Indonesia's tobacco control reform faced opposition by false claims primarily from industry allies, resulting in a 5-year delay in enactment. Future tobacco control media advocacy must address these claims and emphasise the alignment of economic interests with public health goals.

## INTRODUCTION

Smoking prevalence among Indonesian youth aged 10–18 slightly increased from 7.2% in 2013 to 7.4% in 2023, including the use of combustible cigarettes, electronic cigarettes (e-cigarettes), heated tobacco products (HTPs) and shisha.<sup>1 2</sup> E-cigarettes were used by 8.5% of smokers in that

## WHAT IS ALREADY KNOWN ON THIS TOPIC

- ⇒ Evidence from news coverage of tobacco control policies in high-income countries demonstrates a generally positive framing for the adoption and implementation of stronger tobacco control provisions.
- ⇒ A 2016 content analysis of news articles on the implementation of Indonesia's main tobacco control regulation (PP 109/2012) found that most stakeholders' arguments were in favour of a better tobacco control policy to protect young people and people's health.

## WHAT THIS STUDY ADDS

- ⇒ This is the first study to systematically examine news coverage of arguments on tobacco control regulation reform in a developing country where the process was stalled.
- ⇒ Online media articles were fairly split statements on supporting and opposing the amendment of Indonesia's main tobacco control regulation and found new arguments related to the COVID-19 pandemic and e-cigarettes/heated tobacco product issues that were used by both those in favour and against the amendment.

## HOW THIS STUDY MIGHT AFFECT RESEARCH, PRACTICE OR POLICY

- ⇒ Because the continued split of health versus economic framing in the media may hinder the strengthening of tobacco control regulation in Indonesia, media advocacy for tobacco control may want to emphasise the alignment of the economic and development agenda with tobacco control goals.

age group in 2023.<sup>1</sup> Although the smoking prevalence of youth is lower than that of adults aged 20–24 (30.4%), reducing smoking in the 10–18 age group was a priority and set as a national target indicator (RPJMN 2020–2024).<sup>1</sup>

Since 2012, Government Regulation No. 109 Year 2012 (PP 109/2012) has been Indonesia's main tobacco control regulation, including provisions regarding tobacco advertising, promotion and sponsorship (TAPS), health warning labels (HWLs) and underage cigarette sales.<sup>3</sup> However, it does not meet the WHO Framework Convention for Tobacco Control standards.<sup>4</sup> For example, PP 109/2012 requires pictorial HWLs covering 40% of the packaging, allows tobacco advertisements to

air between 21:30 and 5:00 in broadcast media, does not ban smoking in all public indoor spaces and does not regulate HTPs, though an excise tax is applied to these products.<sup>5</sup>

Aiming to reduce youth smoking, the Indonesian Ministry of Health (MoH) has sought to strengthen PP 109/2012 since September 2017.<sup>6</sup> Proposed changes include a full ban on TAPS, increasing HWL size to 90%, banning loose cigarette sales and regulating electronic cigarettes (e-cigarettes) and HTPs the same way as combustible cigarettes.<sup>6</sup> However, strong opposition led to the Ministry of State Secretariat rejecting the MoH's request to initiate the revision in November 2021 due to a perceived lack of comprehensive assessment and consultation with stakeholders.<sup>7</sup> In response, the Coordinating Ministry for Human Development and Culture led a public hearing on the amendment in July 2022. The amendment process has continued to stall.<sup>8</sup>

News media coverage can provide insights into the support and opposition towards a public health issue.<sup>9</sup> A study on news media coverage of PP 109/2012 implementation from 2012 to 2016 highlighted arguments favouring better TAPS policies to protect youth and public health, while opponents expressed concerns about potential harm to the tobacco industry and reduced government income.<sup>10</sup> It is unclear whether these arguments persisted during the amendment process. In high-income countries, news coverage of tobacco control, including plain packaging (Australia; 2008–2014),<sup>11</sup> tobacco point of sale (POS) (eg, licensing, density, advertising) (USA; 2007–2014),<sup>12</sup> smoke-free areas (USA; 2002–2003)<sup>13</sup> and HWLs,<sup>14 14</sup> generally demonstrated positive framing for stronger provisions.

However, previous studies only examined news coverage of tobacco policy changes after successful legislative decisions. No research has been conducted on news media coverage where proposed policy changes have stalled. Additionally, none examined a comprehensive tobacco control regulation; previous studies focused on a specific tobacco policy domain (eg, TAPS, HWL). News content on stakeholder arguments remains understudied in low and middle-income countries despite rapid changes in the tobacco product landscape and attempts to advance and safeguard tobacco control policies. This paper addresses these gaps by examining the online news coverage of arguments and actors for and against the amendment of Indonesia's tobacco control regulation.

## METHODS

We sourced online media articles from Tobacco Watcher ([www.tobaccowatcher.org](http://www.tobaccowatcher.org)), a publicly available media monitoring platform that automatically identifies and categorises tobacco news from over 500 000 global sources. Articles met the following inclusion criteria: published in English or Bahasa Indonesia, focusing on the amendment of PP 109/2012, and published from 29 February 2016, following the last search by Astuti *et al*,<sup>10</sup> through 31 December 2023. We performed the search and coding two times: first, in February 2023, we searched for articles, and between February and June 2023, we coded 311 articles; second, from December 2023 until January 2024, we updated the search and coded an additional 15 articles. We used these keywords for searching: 'amendment', 'revision', 'PP', 'legislation', 'law', 'regulation', 'policy' and 'Indonesia'. We retrieved and screened 958 articles meeting the inclusion criteria for the following exclusion criteria: irrelevant to the PP 109/2012 amendment (n=326), duplicates (n=194) or inaccessible due to paywalls or broken links/URLs (n=112), resulting a total of 326 articles eligible for analysis.

We categorised eligible articles by article type: news (factual account of issues or events), editorial (opinion of news or columnist) and letters/comments (letters to the editor and readers' comments sections). Publication date was recorded. We developed an initial codebook based on a previous study concerning news media coverage of stakeholder arguments on TAPS policy in Indonesia<sup>10</sup> and other literature regarding arguments and support for tobacco control policies presented in news media articles.<sup>11 12 14–16</sup>

We initially reviewed 10% of the eligible articles to further develop the initial codes in the codebook. We established the following variables and corresponding codes for the final codebook: position statement (2 codes), argument type (45 codes), actors (12 codes) and tobacco control measures (10 codes). (Codebook is available in online supplemental 1).

'Position statement' refers to an explicit statement supporting or opposing the PP 109/2012 amendment. 'Argument type' is defined as the content of arguments to support or oppose the amendment. 'Actors' denotes individuals or groups raising arguments. 'Tobacco control measures' pertains to the tobacco control domains mentioned in the argument. We further analysed and categorised coded text within the variables based on their tone or slant in favour or against the amendment. For example, if an actor presented a rationale for supporting the amendment but did not explicitly state favouring the amendment, the actor was still categorised as supportive. We identified categories by coding text segments consisting of part or full sentences in the article and used them as the unit of analysis.

Two coders independently conducted three rounds of coding practice, utilising 15 randomly selected eligible articles (five articles in each round). Subsequently, in a fourth round, the Kappa statistic for inter-rater reliability test was 0.91 for 31 articles (10% of eligible articles).<sup>17 18</sup> The two coders then single-coded the remaining articles, applying the final codebook using MAXQDA V.2022 software.

Data analysis involved an iterative process of reviewing, organising and reporting categories. For the reporting in this paper, we combined categories into 22 categories for argument type, 10 for actors and 10 for tobacco control measures. We described the volume of articles according to article type and publication date and presented the frequency of each category. We coded articles in their original language (95% were in Bahasa Indonesia), and translated quotations in Bahasa Indonesia into English.

## RESULTS

Of the 326 articles, most were news articles (94%); the rest were editorials. Articles were published from 31 May 2018, through 18 December 2023, with the peak publication period being July–December 2022 (23%), followed by January–June 2021 (17%) and July–December 2019 (16%). Between 29 February 2016 and 30 May 2018, we found no article reporting on PP 109/2012 amendment.

### POSITION STATEMENTS AND ARGUMENT TYPES

The position statements presented in online news media were slightly more opposing the amendment (53.3% of total 332 statements), with 20 and 18 argument types used to oppose and support the amendment, respectively (table 1).

The argument types (table 2 and online supplemental 2) used to support the amendment: smoking trend and initiation (21.1% of 1448 supporting arguments), health and safety implications (16.6%), science-based (9.6%) and protecting the population (9.2%). The opposing arguments were predominantly categories

**Table 1** Distribution of supporting and opposing arguments, actors and tobacco control measures in relation to the PP 109/2012 amendment in news articles, 2016–2023

	Total		Supportive		Opposed	
	N	%	N	%	N	%
Argument type	n=2681		n=1448		n=1413	
Smoking trend and initiation	331	11.6	306	21.1	25	1.8
E-cigarette use in the population	50	1.7	50	3.5	0	0.0
Health and safety implications	294	10.3	240	16.6	54	3.8
Protect the population	136	4.8	133	9.2	3	0.2
TAPS/smoking exposure	102	3.6	101	7.0	1	0.1
Accessibility and affordability of tobacco products	38	1.3	37	2.6	1	0.1
Tobacco industry interference	17	0.6	9	0.6	8	0.6
Science-based	174	6.1	139	9.6	35	2.5
COVID-19 pandemic recovery	64	2.2	10	0.7	54	3.8
Country exemplary	78	2.7	60	4.1	18	1.3
Economic impacts	98	3.4	48	3.3	50	3.5
Impact on the industry	232	8.1	0	0.0	232	16.4
Tobacco farmers/workers welfare	253	8.8	18	1.2	235	16.6
Regulatory drafting process	111	3.9	3	0.2	108	7.6
Vested/foreign interest	101	3.5	4	0.3	97	6.9
Amended regulation will not be effective	46	1.6	0	0.0	46	3.3
Illicit trade	30	1.0	0	0.0	30	2.1
Industry's economic/social contribution	138	4.8	4	0.3	134	9.5
Other national/subnational agenda	120	4.2	103	7.1	17	1.2
The current regulation is not sufficient	130	4.5	130	9.0	0	0.0
The current regulation is sufficient	155	5.4	0	0.0	155	11.0
Other	163	5.9	53	3.6	110	7.7
Actors	n=2119		n=858		n=1261	
Civil society organisations (CSO)	652	30.8	349	40.7	303	24.0
Scholars/experts	177	8.4	57	6.6	120	9.5
Health professionals	177	8.4	176	20.5	1	0.1
Government	452	21.3	241	28.1	211	16.7
Farmers	33	1.6	2	0.2	31	2.5
Retailers	9	0.4	0	0.0	9	0.7
E-cigarette consumers	72	3.4	0	0.0	72	5.7
Tobacco industry	253	11.9	0	0.0	253	20.1
Industry front groups	227	10.7	0	0.0	227	18.0
Other	67	3.2	33	3.8	34	2.7
Tobacco control measures	n=293		n=234		n=59	
Tax/price	11	3.8	10	4.3	1	1.7
Smoking cessation service	3	1.0	3	1.3	0	0.0
Tobacco advertisement, promotion, sponsorship (TAPS)	70	23.9	55	23.5	15	25.4
Health warning label (HWL)	73	24.9	53	22.6	20	33.9
E-cigarette/HTP regulation	85	29.0	79	33.8	6	10.2
Institutional capacity	2	0.7	2	0.9	0	0.0
Cigarette sale	28	9.6	16	6.8	12	20.3
Cigarette additives	6	2.0	3	1.3	3	5.1
Smoke-free area	8	2.7	7	3.0	1	1.7
Other	7	2.4	6	2.6	1	1.7

of tobacco farmers/workers' welfare (16.6% of 1413 opposing arguments), impact on the industry (16.4%), and current regulation is sufficient (11.0%).

#### Argument types: supporting the amendment

The 'smoking trend and initiation' argument focused on increased youth smoking in Indonesia while there was a global decrease, attributing the main drivers of smoking initiation to TAPS exposure and affordable cigarettes. This argument asserted

that the rise in Indonesia's smoking prevalence occurred despite the COVID-19 pandemic.

The 'health and safety implications' argument primarily addressed the harms of smoking, and e-cigarette and HTP consumption. There was an indication of the risk of COVID-19 among people who smoke and the impact of COVID-19 on smoking, such as switching to cheaper tobacco products during the pandemic to save money. Many arguments refuted the claim that e-cigarettes are safer than combustible cigarettes and their

**Table 2** Main argument types of supporting and opposing the PP 109/2012 amendment in news articles (2016–2023)

Supporting the amendment	
Argument types	Example of citations
Smoking trend and initiation	'at present, Indonesia is already in a state of emergency regarding smoking children. This is marked by the continuously increasing prevalence of smoking children from year to year. Instead of decreasing, the prevalence of smoking in children has actually risen by 1.9% during the period from 2013 to 2018.'—Indonesian Child Protection Commission (CSO)
Health and safety implications	'This is the part that we observe, and if we don't do something, it will worsen our condition. Not to mention that stunting is also influenced by parents who smoke.'—Tobacco Control National Committee (CSO)
Science-based	'He explained that scientific facts from Indonesia's Drug and Food Control Agency have found that electronic cigarettes contain harmful chemical compounds to health, including: nicotine, propylene glycol, flavouring, metals...'—National Agency of Drug and Food Control (Government)
Protecting the population	'This is where the importance of the state steps in to protect public health by formulating strong and decisive policies to safeguard the well-being of the community.'—Lentera Anak Foundation (CSO)
Opposing the amendment	
Argument types	Example of citations
Tobacco farmers' or workers' welfare	'The revision of PP 109/2012 is intended to jeopardise the livelihoods of 2.5 million tobacco farmers and 1.5 million clove farmers who depend on the tobacco ecosystem.'—Indonesian Tobacco Farmers Association (Industry front group)
Impact on the industry	'They also request that the government stop the revision process of PP 109/2012, as it will pose a significant threat to the survival of the tobacco-related industry ecosystem.'—Association of Tobacco Communities in Indonesia (Industry front group)
Current regulation is sufficient	'It must be considered whether the current revision of PP 109/2012 is urgent or not. In my opinion, the timing is not right. It's better to focus on empowering the community,'—Legal expert (scholar/expert)

effectiveness in aiding smoking cessation ('harm reduction'). Concerns about product safety and ingredients, including the presence of illicit drugs in e-cigarette products, were also cited.

The 'science-based' argument was widely used as the basis of the supporting arguments, such as smoking trends, harmful health effects and TAPS or smoking exposure. Key 'science-based' evidence included population-based survey data demonstrating the rise in smoking prevalence, cigarette expenditure in the country and research findings on the harmful effects of e-cigarettes.

The 'protecting the population' argument underscored the inadequacy of PP 109/2012 in safeguarding public health, particularly youth, from the hazards of smoking, TAPS exposure and the tobacco industry's predatory practices. This argument emphasised the country's legal obligation and national targets for this protection.

### Argument types: opposing the amendment

The 'tobacco farmers' or workers' welfare' argument stressed that the amendment could threaten the livelihoods of those in the tobacco sector, including farmers, factory workers and street vendors, who could face job losses due to the already challenging conditions created by current tobacco control measures. This argument was often presented together with the argument that the labour-intensive tobacco industry significantly contributes to the country's economy.

The 'impact on the industry' argument asserted that the amendment could further burden Indonesia's tobacco sector, which already faced reduced production due to current regulations. Some called for delaying the amendment, citing the industry's postpandemic economic challenges.

The 'current regulation is sufficient' argument deemed the amendment as excessive, arguing that PP 109/2012 remains relevant, comprehensive and effective in reducing smoking and tobacco production. It stated that PP 109/2012 already included the proposed amendment measures, such as banning cigarette sales to minors. Some argued for prioritising actions like improving implementation, public education and addressing

urgent issues like COVID-19 recovery, making the amendment unnecessary.

### ACTORS

More actors opposing the amendment (59.5%) were cited than those supporting it (40.5%) (table 1). The top three actors supporting the amendment included civil society organisations (CSOs), such as groups specific to tobacco control, health and youth/children (40.7% of supporting actors), government, such as MoH and city majors (28.1%), and health professionals (20.5%). International health organisations, such as WHO and the International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease, were other actors (3.8%) favouring the amendment.

The main three actors opposing the amendment were CSOs, such as Kretek Community, Nadlatul Ulama (Islamic organisation), and the Indonesian Chamber of Commerce and Industry (24.0% of opposing actors), the tobacco industry (eg, tobacco/nicotine manufacturers/entrepreneurs (20.1%)), industry front groups ((eg, Indonesian Tobacco Community Alliance (AMTI) (18.0%)). Although less dominant (16.7%), some government and legislative bodies also opposed the amendment, such as the Ministry of Forestry and Agriculture, Ministry of Law and Human Rights, Ministry of Industry, the People's Representative Council and regents of districts where tobacco growing is prominent. Academic experts, such as the rector of an Indonesian university and a public policy observer, comprised 9.5% of opposing actors.

### TOBACCO CONTROL MEASURES

More tobacco control measures were mentioned in all proamendment arguments combined than in anti-amendment arguments combined (79.9% vs 20.1%, table 1). HWLs, e-cigarette/HTP regulation and TAPS were the top three tobacco control measures discussed in the articles, covering 77.8% of tobacco control measures. HWLs and TAPS were predominant in both pro (48.8%) and anti (59.3%) amendment arguments mentioning tobacco control measures. Another main category of tobacco



**Table 3** Main arguments in news articles (2016–2023) used to support and oppose the proposed tobacco control measures in the amendment of PP 109/2012

Tobacco control measures with more support than opposition		
Tobacco control measures (N, % of all supported measures)	Main argument types	Example of citations
Tax/price (10, 4.3%)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▶ Smoking trend and initiation</li> <li>▶ Accessibility and affordability of tobacco products</li> </ul>	'Lisda Sundari, Chairperson of Lentera Anak, emphasised that the revision of PP 109/2012 is crucial for implementing a total ban on cigarette advertisements and <b>raising cigarette prices</b> to the highest possible level <b>to make them unaffordable for children.</b> '
Smoking cessation service (3, 1.3%)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▶ Protect the population</li> <li>▶ Other national/subnational agenda</li> </ul>	'...the <b>National Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMN)</b> has mandated the revision of PP 109/2012, which must be carried out by the Government. The revision includes measures..., such as... <b>strengthening smoking cessation services, to achieve the target of reducing the prevalence of child smokers to 8.7% by 2024</b> in accordance with the RPJMN for the years 2020–2024.'
E-cigarette/HTP regulation (79, 33.8%)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▶ The current regulation is not sufficient</li> <li>▶ Health and safety implications</li> </ul>	'On the other hand, <b>electronic cigarettes</b> , which are now prevalent among teenagers, <b>are not regulated at all</b> , except under excise rules that are more focused on state revenue'
Institutional capacity (2, 0.9%)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▶ E-cigarette use in the population</li> <li>▶ The current regulation is not sufficient</li> </ul>	'Through this revision, it is hoped that <b>BPOM will have the authority to oversee and simultaneously ban</b> the use of electronic cigarettes and vapes, <b>which have recently been widely consumed by the Indonesian public.</b> '
Smoke-free area (7, 3.0%)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▶ Smoking trend and initiation</li> <li>▶ The current regulation is not sufficient</li> </ul>	'According to Oscar, the revision of PP 109 of 2012 aims to strengthen <b>the implementation of smoke-free areas</b> policies to <b>prevent children from starting and trying to consume cigarettes.</b> '
Tobacco control measures with more opposition than support		
Tobacco control measures (N, % of all opposed measures)	Main argument types	Example of citations
Tobacco advertisement, promotion, sponsorship (TAPS) (15, 25.4%)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▶ Amended regulation will not be effective</li> <li>▶ Impact on the industry</li> </ul>	'According to him, <b>there is no guarantee that a total ban on cigarette advertising and promotion</b> will lead to a reduction in mortality rates or mitigate the associated impacts.'
Health warning label (HWL) (20, 33.9%)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▶ Amended regulation will not be effective</li> <li>▶ Impact on the industry</li> </ul>	'"In fact, the revision of PP 109 will require <b>the expansion of graphic health warnings on cigarette packs</b> , which will <b>clearly harm the tobacco industry,</b> " he asserted.'
Cigarette sale (12, 20.3%)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▶ Amended regulation will not be effective</li> <li>▶ Tobacco farmers/workers welfare</li> </ul>	'We agreed to send an official letter to the President to take a wise and judicious decision to cancel the <b>ban on selling retail cigarettes and sticks. We don't want millions of people to lose their income.</b> '
Cigarette additives (3, 5.1%)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▶ Impact on the industry</li> <li>▶ Product appeals and identity</li> </ul>	'If the government <b>revises the additive (article)</b> , it will be the end of kretek cigarettes in Indonesia. Kretek cigarettes have a <b>unique Indonesian characteristic</b> that is not found in other countries...'

control measures mentioned in proamendment arguments was e-cigarette/HTP provision (29.0%), while cigarette sale restrictions (20.3%) were another top category for anti-amendment arguments. Table 3 shows the main arguments supporting and opposing the proposed tobacco control measures.

## DISCUSSION

From 2018 to 2023, online news articles featured slightly more statements opposing the PP 109/2012 amendment than supporting it. A nearly even split between positive and negative framing might partially explain the long delay in the amendment process.<sup>1 19</sup> Opponents argued that the revision to PP 109/2012 is unnecessary and could deprive the industry and tobacco workers. Conversely, supporters presented more evidence-based arguments, primarily asserting increased smoking prevalence, health and safety concerns and youth protection.

The 2016 study on news media coverage of PP 109/2012 implementation also identified health and youth protection as

primary arguments supporting the amendment, and opposition emphasised harms to the tobacco industry and tobacco farmers.<sup>10</sup> Similarly, the pro-regulation actors were predominantly government officials in health, women and children-related bodies and tobacco control advocates, including doctors and scholars.<sup>10</sup> Furthermore, opposition to tobacco control regulation mainly came from tobacco industry alliances, particularly the front groups named as representatives of tobacco farmers and workers.<sup>10 19</sup> The Kretek Community, a prominent Indonesian activist organisation, claims to independently defend kreteks (clove-mixed cigarettes) as cultural heritage, opposing tobacco control as 'foreign threats' while accepting industry money.<sup>20</sup>

Mirroring Indonesia's health tax debate, the opponents from industry-affiliated government institutions, particularly the Ministry of Industry and Ministry of Trade, advocated for fiscal regulations benefitting the tobacco industry, framing it as vital for the domestic sector.<sup>21</sup> The inclusion of tobacco companies and the policy to balance commercial interests and health were

found to be the main challenges in integrating the whole-of-government approach to tobacco control in the Philippines.<sup>22</sup> Since Indonesia has not adopted the whole-of-government approach to tobacco control and non-communicable diseases, it lacks of commitments and robust cross-governmental coordination for tobacco control, with the MoH as the leading sector.<sup>23 24</sup> Without the whole-of-government approach, the industry lobbied to exempt e-cigarettes and HTPs from the amendment and donated for COVID-19 recovery, posing as legitimate stakeholders in tobacco control and hindering the amendment process.<sup>25</sup> Despite this, the tobacco industry's conflict of interests was rarely mentioned or denounced by the proamendment groups in this study.

In contrast to former studies in Indonesia, the USA, Australia and South Korea<sup>10–16</sup> portraying positive views on tobacco control in printed and digital news, our study shows a slightly negative framing. The disparity may be due to our focus on a stalled amendment, whereas earlier studies centred on promulgated or successful policy measures. News coverage likely mirrored the prevalent policy sentiment.<sup>13</sup> Furthermore, compared with previous research,<sup>10–12 14 15 21 26</sup> we found a greater number of arguments from both the proponents and opponents, possibly due to the broad tobacco control domains proposed in the PP 109/2012 amendment. Additionally, using text segments instead of the number of articles for category frequency resulted in counting opposing statements as negative, even within an overall positive framing article.

New arguments found in this study were related to the COVID-19 pandemic and e-cigarette/HTP issues. The COVID-19 pandemic argument, under the health and safety category, was also used against the amendment, advocating prioritisation of COVID-19 recovery policies over the amendment. This creates an opportunity to highlight the link between smoking, severe COVID-19 outcomes and the need for integrating tobacco control into pandemic recovery.<sup>27–29</sup>

Health scientists and experts were divided on e-cigarette and HTP regulation, with five opposing arguments claiming the products to be safer than cigarettes (results available on request). Earlier research also highlighted a positive portrayal of e-cigarettes by academic and research-based institutions in Indonesian news.<sup>30</sup> Mixed evidence on the harms of e-cigarettes and HTPs, with industry-funded studies often favouring the products, may contribute to the division.<sup>31–33</sup> Claims of 'harm reduction' for e-cigarettes and HTPs echoed a policy document analysis from Brazil, which also found that arguments on harm reduction and the potential use of e-cigarettes in smoking cessation were used to oppose a proposed e-cigarette ban in the country.<sup>26</sup> The recent embrace of HTPs in Indonesia, exemplified by the inauguration of PMI's IQOS HEETS factory by the Coordinating Minister for Economic Affairs,<sup>34</sup> could influence the government's stance on the tobacco industry. Moreover, this study revealed a unique science-based category, with more supporting arguments backed by data than opposing claims. Evidence-based supporting arguments can be used against false claims related to tobacco policies.

Categories of safeguarding youth and curbing smoking in supporting arguments align with the primary goals of the amendment.<sup>6</sup> High support from youth-related CSOs and the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection in our findings may be due to Indonesia's national target (RPJMN 2020–2024) aiming to reduce youth smoking from 9.1% to 8.7%.<sup>35</sup> News analysis indicates that youth issues are newsworthy and frequently cited as motives for changes in tobacco policy.<sup>10 36</sup>

Opposing arguments remained dominated by economic claims, focusing on harm to the tobacco industry and workers'

welfare.<sup>10 23</sup> These claims implied a positive image of the tobacco industry in the country, disregarding the economic burden of tobacco consumption and the manipulative and exploitative nature of the industry.<sup>37–39</sup> The welfare of tobacco farmers and workers narrative has been long used to oppose tobacco policy change in Indonesia<sup>10 21 23</sup> and is contradicted by evidence of their economic struggles and low wages regardless of the tobacco control policy.<sup>40–42</sup> Opposition from subnational governments, particularly in regions where tobacco commodity was prevalent, reflects the influence of decentralised governance and a complex bureaucratic landscape.<sup>43</sup> Nonetheless, counternarratives under the economic impacts category used poverty, and healthcare and societal costs associated with smoking. Similarly, some states in the USA incorporated economic loss as part of their rationale for tobacco control laws, highlighting the financial burdens attributed to tobacco consumption.<sup>44</sup>

Opponents argued that the current PP 109/2012 was comprehensive and that other measures, such as smoking prevention education, were more important than amending the regulation. This argument tends to divert attention from the need to adopt stronger tobacco control policies. Previous research highlighted a focus on individual-level education rather than policy changes in the news around the issue of youth tobacco use.<sup>36</sup> In reality, loopholes, such as the partial TAPS ban, did exist in PP 109/2012, which allowed the industry to exploit them by displaying tobacco products in POS locations and sponsoring education, music and sports events.<sup>45–47</sup>

We found HWL and TAPS were the most contested tobacco control domains, with the category of e-cigarette or HTP regulation primarily discussed in arguments favouring the amendment. Similarly, the Australian plain packaging policy faced public opposition in online news comments, claiming ineffectiveness.<sup>48</sup> Two decades ago, secondhand smoke and tobacco education and cessation were the main issues covered by Australian newspapers,<sup>15</sup> demonstrating the shift in importance and popularity of tobacco control measures, possibly due to the change in the tobacco product landscape and tobacco industry tactics.

We did not find discourse on human rights or the environmental impacts of tobacco consumption, topics of increasing global concern.<sup>49 50</sup> Additionally, the voices of people who smoke, those directly affected by tobacco consumption,<sup>16</sup> were under-represented, accounting for less than 3% of actors identified (under 'other' category). Emphasising their alignment with tobacco control goals might help in garnering support for legislative reforms.<sup>51 52</sup>

This study does not reflect the public's organic view towards the amendment, which may better be captured in public opinion surveys and social media analysis. Additionally, the study does not account for the reader's perspective, a factor often revealed through online news commentary, as demonstrated in a study on Australian online news.<sup>48</sup> Furthermore, this study does not include paywalled news, nor does it weigh the importance, influence, or readership of arguments and articles, potentially overlooking variations. While we did not find literature on news coverage that presented more negative than positive framing towards tobacco control before the passage of the policy, there is the possibility of publication bias or the absence of study around this negative sentiment.

However, this is the first study to systematically identify news coverage of stakeholder arguments focused on the amendment of a tobacco control regulation in a developing country with a stalled process, offering insights for policymakers and advocates to inform current tobacco policy change efforts. Although the amendment process was stopped, in July 2024, Indonesia passed

Government Regulations No. 28/2024 pertaining to Health, which contains a set of strengthened tobacco control provisions, mirroring those in the proposed PP 109/2012 amendment.<sup>53</sup> Similarly, the drafting process of the Government Regulations was very slow, lacked transparency and public participation and received strong opposition from the protobacco industry.<sup>53</sup>

Media advocacy involving CSOs and media collaboration in favour of tobacco control should emphasise the alignment of the country's economic and development targets with tobacco control goals. Additionally, it is important to expose tobacco industry conduct by broadening the advocacy network and extending the narrative,<sup>54 55</sup> such as highlighting the tobacco industry's violation of human rights and harm to the country's economy and people's welfare. Focusing on tobacco industry denormalisation may also protect public health policy from the industry's vested interests and foster cross-sectoral support within the government.<sup>23</sup> Lessons learnt from Australia and the Philippines demonstrate that the whole-of-government approach to non-communicable diseases could advance interministerial coordination and policy coherence and support the incorporation of health considerations in every policy-making process, including tobacco control.<sup>22 56</sup>

In conclusion, the reform of tobacco control regulation in Indonesia encountered significant contention, with wide-ranging pros and cons arguments presented in online news articles from 2018 to 2023. False claims remained used in opposing the amendment despite strong rationale favouring it, leading to a 5-year delay in enactment. Future media advocacy in Indonesia should use counterarguments to denormalise the tobacco industry and highlight the alignment of economic interests with public health goals to advance effective tobacco control policies.

X Beladenta Amalia @beladenta and Putu Ayu Swandewi Astuti @drayuswandewi

**Acknowledgements** The authors would like to thank Ananta Stokhorst for his contribution as the second coder, Lauren Czaplicki for providing document analysis training for both coders and John W. Ayers for the assistance in data retrieval on Tobacco Watcher.

**Contributors** JEC and BA conceived the study. BA and PASA developed the codebook. BA conducted the analyses. BA wrote the first draft of the article. All authors contributed to the writing and editing of the manuscript. JEC is the guarantor.

**Funding** This work was supported with funding from Bloomberg Philanthropies' Bloomberg Initiative to Reduce Tobacco Use (bloomberg.org) (47580).

**Competing interests** JEC is a paid consultant in litigation against a tobacco company.

**Patient consent for publication** Not applicable.

**Ethics approval** Not applicable.

**Provenance and peer review** Not commissioned; externally peer-reviewed.

**Data availability statement** Data are available upon reasonable request. Data are available upon reasonable request by contacting the corresponding author.

**Supplemental material** This content has been supplied by the author(s). It has not been vetted by BMJ Publishing Group Limited (BMJ) and may not have been peer-reviewed. Any opinions or recommendations discussed are solely those of the author(s) and are not endorsed by BMJ. BMJ disclaims all liability and responsibility arising from any reliance placed on the content. Where the content includes any translated material, BMJ does not warrant the accuracy and reliability of the translations (including but not limited to local regulations, clinical guidelines, terminology, drug names and drug dosages), and is not responsible for any error and/or omissions arising from translation and adaptation or otherwise.

**Open access** This is an open access article distributed in accordance with the Creative Commons Attribution Non Commercial (CC BY-NC 4.0) license, which permits others to distribute, remix, adapt, build upon this work non-commercially, and license their derivative works on different terms, provided the original work is properly cited, appropriate credit is given, any changes made indicated, and the use is non-commercial. See: <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>.

## ORCID iDs

Beladenta Amalia <http://orcid.org/0000-0002-9718-2693>  
Putu Ayu Swandewi Astuti <http://orcid.org/0000-0002-4723-212X>  
Joanna E Cohen <http://orcid.org/0000-0002-3869-3637>

## REFERENCES

- 1 Kementerian Kesehatan RI. Survei kesehatan indonesia (SKI) 2023 dalam angka. Jakarta: Badan Kebijakan Pembangunan Kesehatan; 2024.
- 2 Kementerian Kesehatan RI. Riset Kesehatan Dasar 2013. Jakarta: Badan Penelitian dan Pengembangan Kesehatan, 2013.
- 3 Indonesia - Law | Tobacco Control Laws; 2012.109. Available: <https://www.tobaccocontrollaws.org/laws/pp-no-109-of-2012-indonesia> [accessed 27 Nov 2023]
- 4 WHO framework convention on tobacco control. Available: <https://fctc.who.int/publications/i/item/9241591013> [Accessed 27 Nov 2023].
- 5 Countries/jurisdictions | global tobacco control. Available: <https://www.globaltobaccocontrol.org/en/policy-scan/e-cigarettes/countries?country=95> [Accessed 27 Nov 2023].
- 6 Kementerian Kesehatan RI. Rancangan perubahan peraturan pemerintah republik indonesia no.109 tahun 2012. 2022.
- 7 Manan N, Ramadhan A, Widiadana R, et al. *Medan Laga Pengendalian Rokok Di Indonesia*. LSPR Publishing, 2022.
- 8 Kementerian Koordinator Bidang Pembangunan Manusia dan Kebudayaan. Uji publik revisi PP nomor 109 tahun 2012 dilakukan demi masa depan anak bangsa. Kemenko PMK; 2022. Available: <https://www.kemenkopmk.go.id/uji-publik-revisi-pp-nomor-109-tahun-2012-dilakukan-demi-masa-depan-anak-bangsa> [Accessed 14 Oct 2022].
- 9 Dorfman L. Studying the news on public health: how content analysis supports media advocacy. *Am J Health Behav* 2003;27 Suppl 3:S217–26.
- 10 Astuti PAS, Freeman B. "It is merely a paper tiger." Battle for increased tobacco advertising regulation in Indonesia: content analysis of news articles. *BMJ Open* 2017;7:e016975.
- 11 Miller CL, Brownbill AL, Dono J, et al. Presenting a strong and united front to tobacco industry interference: a content analysis of Australian newspaper coverage of tobacco plain packaging 2008-2014. *BMJ Open* 2018;8:e023485.
- 12 Myers AE, Southwell BG, Ribisl KM, et al. Setting the agenda for a healthy retail environment: content analysis of US newspaper coverage of tobacco control policies affecting the point of sale, 2007-2014. *Tob Control* 2017;26:406–14.
- 13 Smith KC, Siebel C, Pham L, et al. News on tobacco and public attitudes toward smokefree air policies in the United States. *Health Policy* 2008;86:42–52.
- 14 Hwang J-E, Cho S-I, Lee SG. Setting the policy agenda for graphic health warning labels: an analysis of online news media coverage in South Korea, 2016. *Tob Induc Dis* 2020;18:64.
- 15 Durrant R, Wakefield M, McLeod K, et al. Tobacco in the news: an analysis of newspaper coverage of tobacco issues in Australia, 2001. *Tob Control* 2003;12 Suppl 2:ii75–81.
- 16 McLeod K, Wakefield M, Chapman S, et al. Changes in the news representation of smokers and tobacco-related media advocacy from 1995 to 2005 in Australia. *J Epidemiol Community Health* 2009;63:215–20.
- 17 Klartz U, Rädiker S. Analyzing qualitative data with MAXQDA. In: *Analyzing intercoder agreement*. Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2019: 267–82.
- 18 Brennan RL, Prediger DJ. Coefficient Kappa: some Uses, Misuses, and Alternatives. *Educ Psychol Meas* 1981;41:687–99.
- 19 Lobby Groups - TobaccoTactics. Available: <https://tobaccotactics.org/article/lobby-groups/> [Accessed 30 Nov 2023].
- 20 Welker M. Indonesia's Cigarette Culture Wars: contesting Tobacco Regulations in the Postcolony. *Comp Stud Soc Hist* 2021;63:911–47.
- 21 Ahsan A, Amalia N, Rahmayanti KP, et al. Health taxes in Indonesia: a review of policy debates on the tobacco, alcoholic beverages and sugar-sweetened beverage taxes in the media. *BMJ Glob Health* 2023;8:e012042.
- 22 Lencucha R, Drope J, Chavez JJ. Whole-of-government approaches to NCDs: the case of the Philippines Interagency Committee-Tobacco. *Health Policy Plan* 2015;30:844–52.
- 23 Astuti PAS, Assunta M, Freeman B. Why is tobacco control progress in Indonesia stalled? - A qualitative analysis of interviews with tobacco control experts. *BMC Public Health* 2020;20:527.
- 24 Kramer E, Ahsan A, Rees VW. Policy incoherence and tobacco control in Indonesia: an analysis of the national tobacco-related policy mix. *Tob Control* 2023;32:410–7.
- 25 Assunta M. Global tobacco industry interference index 2023. Bangkok, 2023.
- 26 Nunes-Rubinstein M, Leão T. Arguments used by proponents and opponents in Brazil's regulatory discussions of e-cigarettes and heated tobacco products. *Tob Control* 2023;32:296–301.
- 27 Poudel R, Daniels LB, DeFilippis AP, et al. Smoking is associated with increased risk of cardiovascular events, disease severity, and mortality among patients hospitalized for SARS-CoV-2 infections. *PLoS ONE* 2022;17:e0270763.
- 28 Clift AK, von Ende A, Tan PS, et al. Smoking and COVID-19 outcomes: an observational and Mendelian randomisation study using the UK Biobank cohort. *Thorax* 2022;77:65–73.

- 29 The Role of the WHO FCTC in COVID-19 Responses - STOP, Available: <https://exposetobacco.org/resource/counter-tactics-maximize-health/> [Accessed 28 Nov 2023].
- 30 Bigwanto M, Arumsari I, Fauzi R. The portrayal of electronic cigarettes in Indonesia: a content analysis of news media. *BMC Public Health* 2023;23:1–10.
- 31 Pisinger C, Godtfredsen N, Bender AM. A conflict of interest is strongly associated with tobacco industry—favourable results, indicating no harm of e-cigarettes. *Prev Med* 2019;119:124–31.
- 32 University of Bath. Foundation for a smoke-free world grants tobacco tactics. 2022. Available: <https://tobaccotactics.org/wiki/foundation-for-a-smoke-free-world-grantees/> [Accessed 4 Nov 2022].
- 33 Hendlin YH, Vora M, Elias J, et al. Financial Conflicts of Interest and Stance on Tobacco Harm Reduction: a Systematic Review. *Am J Public Health* 2019;109:e1–8.
- 34 PMI inaugurates HEETS factory in indonesia – tobacco reporter. Available: <https://tobaccoreporter.com/2023/01/18/pmi-inaugurates-heets-factory-in-indonesia/> [Accessed 30 Nov 2023].
- 35 Indonesia's coordinating minister for human development and culture calls for strong tobacco control policies, urges amendments to PP 109/2012 | the union. Available: <https://theunion.org/news/indonesia%E2%80%99s-coordinating-minister-for-human-development-and-culture-calls-for-strong-tobacco-control-policies-urges-amendments-to-pp-1092012> [Accessed 28 Nov 2023].
- 36 Smith KC, Wakefield M. Newspaper coverage of youth and tobacco: implications for public health. *Health Commun* 2006;19:19–28.
- 37 Saputra AF. The Dark Side of Tobacco Industry's CSR: a Socio-Legal Analysis of the Indonesian Corporate Hegemony Campaign. *IJLS* 2021;2:1.
- 38 Meilissa Y, Nugroho D, Luntungan NN, et al. The 2019 economic cost of smoking-attributable diseases in Indonesia. *Tob Control* 2022;31:s133–9.
- 39 Mandracchia F. Indonesian tobacco: a consumer culture of exploitation. Proceedings of GREAT Day; 2019
- 40 Sahadewo GA, Drope J, Li Q, et al. Tobacco or not tobacco: predicting farming households' income in Indonesia. *Tob Control* 2021;30:320–7.
- 41 Sahadewo GA, Iglesias RM, Araujo EC, et al. The economics of tobacco taxation and employment in indonesia: health population and nutrition global practice (english). Washington DC; 2018.
- 42 Sahadewo GA, Drope J, Li Q, et al. In-and-Out of Tobacco Farming: shifting Behavior of Tobacco Farmers in Indonesia. *Int J Environ Res Public Health* 2020;17:9416.
- 43 Kramer EMasdukiMRosemary R, et al. How do National laws filter down to the local? Tobacco control regulations and smoke free areas in a decentralised Indonesia. 2023;42:216–41.
- 44 Kong AY, Qingzi Tao V, Golden SD. A thematic content analysis of 2010-2015 state tobacco control legislation in the United States: bill rationales and priority populations. *Prev Med Rep* 2023;36:102446.
- 45 Septiono W, Kuipers MAG, Ng N, et al. Self-reported exposure of Indonesian adolescents to online and offline tobacco advertising, promotion and sponsorship (TAPS). *Tob Control* 2022;31:98–105.
- 46 Astuti PAS, Kurniasari NMD, Mulyawan KH, et al. From glass boxes to social media engagement: an audit of tobacco retail marketing in Indonesia. *Tob Control* 2019;28:e133–40.
- 47 Tandilittin H, Luetge C. CSR activity of tobacco companies in Indonesia: is it a genuine social responsibility? *J Health Ethics* 2015;11:3.
- 48 Freeman B. Tobacco plain packaging legislation: a content analysis of commentary posted on Australian online news. *Tob Control* 2011;20:361–6.
- 49 Novotny TE, Bialous SA, Burt L, et al. The environmental and health impacts of tobacco agriculture, cigarette manufacture and consumption. *Bull World Health Organ* 2015;93:877–80.
- 50 Sircar NR, Bialous SA. Assessing the links between human rights and global tobacco control through statements made on global fora. *BMC Public Health* 2021;21:439.
- 51 Kyriakos CN, Fong GT, de Abreu Perez C, et al. Brazilian smokers are ready for the ban on flavour additives in tobacco to be implemented. *Prev Med* 2022;160:107074.
- 52 Chung-Hall J, Fong GT, Driezen P, et al. Smokers' support for tobacco endgame measures in Canada: findings from the 2016 International Tobacco Control Smoking and Vaping Survey. *CMAJ Open* 2018;6:E412–22.
- 53 Arlinta D. The government should not hesitate to strengthen smoking control regulations kompas.id. 2023. Available: <https://www.kompas.id/baca/english/2023/11/22/en-pemerintah-jangan-ragu-perkuat-aturan-pengendalian-rokok> [Accessed 30 Jun 2024].
- 54 Matthes BK, Robertson L, Gilmore AB. Needs of LMIC-based tobacco control advocates to counter tobacco industry policy interference: insights from semi-structured interviews. *BMJ Open* 2020;10:e044710.
- 55 Gilmore AB, Fooks G, Drope J, et al. Exposing and addressing tobacco industry conduct in low-income and middle-income countries. *The Lancet* 2015;385:1029–43.
- 56 Crosbie E, Thomson G, Freeman B, et al. Advancing progressive health policy to reduce NCDs amidst international commercial opposition: tobacco standardised packaging in Australia. *Glob Public Health* 2018;13:1753–66.



Supplementary 1. Codebook of content analysis of online media coverage of PP 109/2012 revision. Examples of use were derived from 10% of eligible articles reviewed during codebook development.				
Variable	Theme	Description	Examples of use (English translation)	Examples of use (Bahasa Indonesia)
<b>Tobacco control measures:</b> Code for statements about tobacco control measures that will or are suggested to be regulated or included in the amendment of PP 109/2012	Tax	Statements directly identify or imply that increasing tax of tobacco products, including e-cigarettes and heated tobacco products, will be OR suggested to be regulated or included in the revised PP 109/2012	Therefore, it is time for the government to revise Government Regulation Number 109 of 2012 concerning the Control of Materials Containing Addictive Substances in the Form of Tobacco Products for Health. One way is by simplifying the tobacco excise tariff structure to reduce the prevalence of child smokers.	Oleh sebab itu, saatnya pemerintah mampu merevisi Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 109 tahun 2012 tentang Pengamanan Bahan yang Mengandung Zat Adiktif Berupa Produk Tembakau Bagi Kesehatan. Salah satunya dengan menyederhanakan struktur tarif cukai hasil tembakau demi penurunan prevalensi perokok anak.
	Smoking cessation service	Statements directly identify or imply that scaling up or improving smoking cessation service(s) will be OR suggested to be regulated or included in the revised PP 109/2012	With the policy agenda of increasing tobacco taxes, expanding smoking cessation services, implementing a total ban on cigarette advertisements and promotions, and enlarging the display of graphic warning labels on the dangers of smoking.	Dengan agenda kebijakan peningkatan cukai hasil tembakau, perluasan layanan berhenti merokok, pelarangan total iklan dan promosi rokok, dan perbesar pencantuman peringatan bergambar bahaya merokok.
	Tobacco ads, promotion, sponsorship (TAPS)	Statements directly identify or imply that banning or increasing the restrictions on tobacco product, including e-cigarettes and heated tobacco products, advertisement, promotion, and sponsorship (TAPS) will be OR suggested to be regulated or included in the revised PP 109/2012	Lisda Sundari, Chairperson of Lentera Anak, emphasises that the revision of PP 109/2012 is crucial to regulate a complete ban on cigarette advertisements and to raise cigarette prices as high as possible to make them unaffordable for children.	Lisda Sundari, Ketua Lentera Anak, menegaskan revisi PP 109/2012 sangat penting untuk mengatur pelarangan iklan rokok secara total dan menaikkan harga rokok setinggi-tingginya agar tidak terjangkau anak.
	Health warning label (HWL)	Statements directly identify or imply that increasing the size of health warning label on the packages of tobacco products, including e-cigarettes and heated tobacco products, will be OR suggested to be regulated or included in the revised PP 109/2012	Some of the rules that will be changed, as far as the association knows, include plans to expand the size of health warning images from the current 40% of the packaging area to 90%.	Beberapa aturan yang akan diubah, sepengetahuan asosiasi meliputi, pertama terkait rencana memperluas ukuran gambar peringatan kesehatan dari yang semula 40% dari luas kemasan menjadi 90%.
	E-cigarette/HTP regulation	Statements directly identify or imply the ban or restrictions on e-cigarette and heated tobacco products, will be OR suggested to be regulated or included in the revised PP 109/2012	Now the government is taking bolder steps through the Food and Drug Supervisory Agency (BPOM) by proposing a ban on the use of electronic cigarettes and vape in Indonesia. One of the proposals is through the revision of Government Regulation No. 109 Year 2012.	Sekarang Pemerintah mengambil langkah lebih berani melalui Badan Pengawas Obat dan Makanan (BPOM) mengusulkan pelarangan penggunaan rokok elektrik dan vape di Indonesia. Salah satu usulannya melalui revisi PP Nomor 109 Tahun 2012.
	Institutional capacity	Statements directly identify or imply that building the institutional capacity or authority in overseeing tobacco control will be OR suggested to be regulated or included in the revised PP 109/2012	Through this revision, it is hoped that BPOM can have the authority to oversee and ban the use of electronic cigarettes and vape, which have recently been widely consumed by the Indonesian public	Melalui revisi itu diharapkan BPOM dapat kewenangan mengawasi sekaligus melarang penggunaan rokok elektrik dan vape yang belakangan ini banyak dikonsumsi masyarakat Indonesia
	Sale of cigarette sticks	Statements directly identify or imply that prohibiting the single stick sales of cigarette or kretek products will be OR suggested to be regulated or included in the revised PP 109/2012	Because in the government regulation, one of the things mentioned is the ban on the sale of individual cigarettes.	Sebab dalam revisi PP itu, salah satunya disebutkan ada larangan penjualan rokok batangan.
	Cigarette additives	Statements directly identify or imply that prohibiting additives in tobacco product's ingredients will be OR suggested to be regulated or included in the revised PP 109/2012	There is news that the content of the PP includes plans to ban several types of additives in cigarettes.	ada kabar konten di PP tersebut rencananya ada pelarangan untuk beberapa jenis bahan tambahan di dalam rokok.
	Smoke-free area	Statements directly identify or imply that enhancing smoke-free policy (kawasan tanpa rokok/KTR) will be OR suggested to be regulated or included in the revised PP 109/2012	This issue of smoke-free areas needs to be strengthened in PP No. 109 of 2012 Concerning Materials that Contain Addictive Substances	Persoalan KTR ini perlu diperkuat dalam PP 109/2012 tentang Pengamanan Zat adiktif," ujarnya.
	Other	Does not fit any Tobacco control measure category. Must provide description in your own words.		
<b>Argument position:</b> Code for statements that discuss position/sentiment towards PP 109/2012 amendment issue	Supporting the amendment	Statements explicitly support the PP 109/2012 revision or its measures	"We, from LPAI, urge the Minister of Health to complete the revision of Government Regulation No. 109 of 2012 Concerning Materials that Contain Addictive Substances in Tobacco Products to protect children's health," said Kak Seto.	"Kami dari LPAI mendesak Menteri Kesehatan untuk menyelesaikan revisi PP 109 tahun 2012 tentang pengamanan bahan yang mengandung zat adiktif berupa produk tembakau bagi kesehatan untuk melindungi anak," ujar Kak Seto.
	Opposing the amendment	Statements explicitly oppose the PP 109/2012 revision or its measures	The entire chain of the tobacco industry ecosystem condemns the resurgence of pressure from parties who want to revise Government Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia No. 109 of 2012 (PP 109/2012) Concerning Materials that Contain Addictive Substances in Tobacco Products	Seluruh mata rantai elemen ekosistem pertembakauan mengancam kembali munculnya desakan dari pihak-pihak yang ingin merevisi Peraturan Pemerintah Republik Indonesia No 109 tahun 2012 (PP 109/2012) tentang Pengamanan Bahan Yang Mengandung Zat Adiktif Berupa Produk Tembakau Bagi Kesehatan.
<b>Argument type:</b> Code for types of arguments related to the revision of PP 109/2012	Smoking trend in population	Discussion of smoking trend among general or other than young population, including mention on number, rates/prevalence, increase or decrease in smoking, and control of smoking rates in population. DO NOT CODE for statements specific to e-cigarette use OR young people	For 10 years, the regulation has been in the process of being enacted, but in reality, there has been a significant increase in the number of adult smokers from 2011 to 2021, which increased from 60.3 to 69.1 million people	Selama 10 Tahun PP tersebut dalam proses diundangkan, kenyataannya terdapat peningkatan signifikan jumlah perokok dewasa dari Tahun 2011-2021, yaitu dari 60,3 menjadi 69,1 juta orang (Global Adult Tobacco Survey, 2022).
	Smoking trend in youth	Discussion of smoking trend among young people, including mention on number, rates/prevalence, increase or decrease in smoking, and control of smoking rates among young population. Youth includes "anak-anak" (children), "remaja" (teens), "generasi muda" (young generation), "di bawah umur" (underage), "generasi penerus bangsa" (the nation's next generation). DO NOT CODE for statements specific to e-cigarette use.	Based on the 2018 Riskesdas data, the prevalence of child smokers aged 10 to 18 years old continues to increase every year. In 2013, there were 7.2 percent of children who smoked, and it increased to 9.1 percent in 2018.	berdasarkan data Riskesdas tahun 2018, prevalensi perokok anak usia 10 hingga 18 tahun terus meningkat dari tahun ke tahun. Pada 2013 terdapat 7,2 persen anak dan meningkat pada 2018 menjadi 9,1 persen.
	Smoking initiation in population	Discussion of smoking uptake among general or other than young population, including statements on smoking experimentation. DO NOT CODE for argument specific to e-cigarette uptake or specific to youth	Director of Health Promotion and Community Empowerment at the Ministry of Health, Rizkiyana Sukandhi Putra, stated that Health Promotion Warnings (PHW) are indeed one of the most effective and inexpensive efforts to reduce the prevalence of novice smokers.	Direktur Promosi Kesehatan dan Pemberdayaan Masyarakat Kemkes Rizkiyana Sukandhi Putra menyatakan PHW memang termasuk upaya paling efektif dan murah untuk menurunkan prevalensi perokok pemula.
	Smoking initiation in youth	Discussion of smoking uptake among young people, including statements on smoking experimentation. DO NOT CODE for statements specific to e-cigarette use.	The existence of cigarette advertisements and promotions that use aggressive cigarette advertising strategies, highlighting creative, trendy, cool, modern, and great themes, will continue to encourage children to try cigarettes	Dengan adanya iklan dan promosi rokok yang menggunakan strategi iklan rokok yang gencar, menonjolkan tema kreatif, gaul, keren, modern, dan hebat. Anak-anak akan terus terdorong untuk mencoba rokok.
	Tobacco/nicotine use cessation	Discussion on quitting smoking or e-cigarette use, including reduction in cigarette use (e.g., number of cigarette per day). DO NOT CODE for statements mentioning complete or partial switch or transition to other tobacco/nicotine products	They revealed that a study in Asia published in BMC Public Health in 2018 showed that the expansion of PHW is effective in reducing the desire to smoke in children and increasing the desire to quit smoking in active smokers.	Mereka mengungkapkan, sebuah studi di Asia yang dimuat dalam BMC Public Health tahun 2018, menunjukkan perluasan PHW efektif dalam menurunkan keinginan merokok pada anak dan meningkatkan keinginan berhenti merokok pada perokok aktif.
	Protect the population	Statements explicitly mention protection of general population or other than young people from the harm of tobacco/nicotine products. DO NOT CODE if it's specific to young people	PMK is committed to revising Government Regulation No. 109 of 2012 as an effort of the country to protect the people from things that are not beneficial, while tobacco products in the form of cigarettes do not provide benefits to humans.	PMK berkomitmen revisi PP 109/2012 adalah upaya Negara melindungi rakyat dari hal hal yang tidak bermanfaat sementara produk tembakau berupa rokok tidak memberikan manfaat bagi manusia.
	Protect young people	Statements explicitly mention protecting young people from the harm of tobacco/nicotine products	"We, from LPAI, urge the Minister of Health to complete the revision of Government Regulation No. 109 of 2012 Concerning Materials that Contain Addictive Substances in Tobacco Products to protect children's health," said Kak Seto.	"Kami dari LPAI mendesak Menteri Kesehatan untuk menyelesaikan revisi PP 109 tahun 2012 tentang pengamanan bahan yang mengandung zat adiktif berupa produk tembakau bagi kesehatan untuk melindungi anak," ujar Kak Seto.
	Industry exploits or targets youth	Statements explicitly mention that tobacco/nicotine industry targets or exploits young people, including through tobacco ads, promotion, sponsorship, cheap products	"Children have become victims of the exploitation of the tobacco industry which continues to actively target children as a long-term consumer base, because the younger the age of smoking, the greater the profits for tobacco companies," he said.	"Anak-anak sudah menjadi korban dari eksploitasi industri rokok yang terus aktif menasar anak sebagai basis konsumen jangka panjang, karena dengan semakin dini usia merokok akan makin besar juga keuntungan bagi perusahaan rokok," katanya.

	E-cigarette use in the population	Discussion of e-cigarette use trend and initiation in general or other than young population, including statement on number, rate/prevalence, increase or decrease in e-cigarette use, and e-cigarette uptake among general/adult population. DO NOT CODE if statement is specific to young people	Tulus stated that electronic cigarettes have now become a new epidemic within society.	Tulus mengatakan, saat ini rokok elektronik sudah menjadi wabah baru di tengah masyarakat
	E-cigarette use in youth	Discussion of e-cigarette use trend and initiation among young people, including statement on number, rate/prevalence, increase or decrease in e-cigarette use, and e-cigarette uptake among young people	"A simple proof that the electronic cigarette industry targets children and adolescents is the tenfold increase in the use of electronic cigarettes among teenagers in just two years," explained Bigwanto.	"Bukti sederhana bahwa industri rokok elektronik menasar kelompok anak dan remaja adalah peningkatan penggunaan rokok elektronik pada kelompok remaja sebesar sepuluh kali lipat hanya dalam waktu 2 tahun," terang Bigwanto
	Childhood stunting	Statements explicitly mention childhood stunting in relation to tobacco product consumption, including efforts to reduce the stunting rate in children	Moreover, obtained from various sources, as many as 19% of stunted children are born to families with smokers. This certainly needs attention from the government, considering that stunting is also a National Priority Program targeted to decrease up to 14% in 2024.	Terlebih diperoleh dari berbagai sumber, sebanyak 19% anak stunting lahir dari keluarga yang perokok. Tentu hal ini perlu mendapatkan perhatian dari pemerintah, mengingat isu stunting juga menjadi Program Prioritas Nasional yang ditargetkan turun s/d 14% pada Tahun 2024.
	Exposure to smoking/tobacco ads	Discussion on exposure to smoking activities or tobacco/nicotine product promotion or sponsorship in general population, including youth. This may include statement on the presence of tobacco/nicotine product ads, promotion, and sponsorship alone.	Furthermore, Hery revealed that according to a RAYA survey, it shows that cigarette advertisements that are quite rampant through the internet have a high risk of being accessed or seen by children and adolescents.	Lebih lanjut, Hery mengungkapkan berdasarkan survei RAYA menunjukkan iklan rokok yang cukup marak melalui internet memiliki risiko tinggi untuk dapat diakses atau dilihat anak-anak dan remaja.
	Other national/subnational agenda	Discussion of how PP 109/2012 amendment, or other regulations, might (not) support or compatible with the other Indonesia government's agenda or targets, including sustainable development goals (SDGs), the national development plans (RPJMN), subnational government program and President's authorization to revise the regulation (Keputusan Presiden Nomor 9 Tahun 2018).	Arist also mentioned the National Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMN) 2020-2024, which has a target to decrease the prevalence of child smokers from 9.1 percent in 2018 to 8.7 percent in 2024.	Arist juga menyinggung soal Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Nasional (RPJMN) 2020-2024, yang salah satu targetnya adalah menurunkan perokok anak dari 9,1 persen pada tahun 2018 menjadi 8,7 persen pada 2024.
	Association of COVID-19 and smoking	Statements directly identify or imply the link between smoking and COVID-19 disease, including how the COVID-19 pandemic might affect the smoking behavior	Lentera Anak believes that the current Covid-19 pandemic situation is the right momentum for the government to immediately complete the revision of PP 109/2012. Because during the pandemic, children are not only potentially exposed to cigarette smoke at home, but also have the opportunity to become smokers outside the home.	Lentera Anak, kata dia, menilai kondisi pandemi Covid-19 saat ini merupakan momentum tepat bagi Pemerintah untuk segera menyelesaikan revisi PP 109/2012. Karena di masa pandemi, anak-anak tidak hanya berpotensi terpapar asap rokok di rumah, tetapi juga berpeluang menjadi perokok di luar rumah. (Lentera Anak Desak Menkes Revisi PP Tembakau untuk Kurangi Pero, Pos. 13)
	COVID-19 Pandemic response	Discussion of how the PP109/2012 amendment OR tobacco industry's role might contribute to or affect the COVID-19 pandemic response. MAY BE DOUBLE CODED with "Industry's economic/social contribution to the country"	The prolonged polemic over the revision of PP 109/2012, which drains the government's energy, should not occur when Indonesia is struggling to face the pandemic. "The Ministry of Health should be supported to focus on resolving the pandemic and strengthening its	Polemik berkepanjangan revisi PP 109/2012 yang menguras energi pemerintah semestinya tidak perlu terjadi saat Indonesia sedang berjibaku menghadapi pandemi. "Kementerian Kesehatan harus kita dukung untuk fokus menyelesaikan pandemi dan
	Industry's economic/social contribution	Statements directly identify or imply the impact of tobacco/nicotine industry on the country's economy or social conditions. Usually frame the amendment as a threat to government's revenue/investment. DO NOT CODE for statements specific to the impact on tobacco/nicotine industry or tobacco workers/farmers	The campaigns driven by both domestic and foreign parties regarding the revision of PP 109/2012, ignore the contribution of the tobacco ecosystem, which has been a support for state revenue through tobacco excise taxes (CHT).	Kampanye yang didorong baik dari dalam negeri maupun pihak asing terkait revisi PP 109 /2012, memungkirkan kontribusi ekosistem pertembakauan yang selama ini menjadi penopang penerimaan negara melalui cukai hasil tembakau (CHT).
	Threat to the economy	Statements directly identify or imply the negative impact of tobacco control policies OR smoking/ e-cigarette use on the country's economy and society, including the government's health expenses due to smoking-related diseases and lack of job opportunities. DO NOT CODE for statements specific to double burden impact of smoking/nicotine consumption	Not only does it threaten the quality of Indonesia's human resources, but smoking also threatens public health, which according to Finance Minister Sri Mulyani in 2021, the healthcare cost due to smoking reached IDR 27.7 trillion per year, of which IDR 15.6 trillion is the cost of treatment borne by BPJS.	Tidak hanya mengancam kualitas SDM Indonesia, rokok juga mengancam kesehatan masyarakat dimana menurut Menkeu Sri Mulyani pada Tahun 2021, biaya kesehatan akibat merokok mencapai Rp 27,7 Triliun pertahun, sedangkan Rp 15,6 Triliun merupakan biaya perawatan yang dikeluarkan oleh BPJS.
	Not threat to the economy	Statements explicitly or implicitly deny the disadvantage of tobacco control policies OR smoking on government's revenue/income or society	He conveyed that the loss of cigarette advertisements did not significantly affect the revenue of the region. Because, after the cigarette advertisements were removed, there were immediately other advertisements filling in.	Dia menyampaikan hilangnya iklan rokok tidak banyak memengaruhi pendapatan daerah. Sebab, setelah iklan rokok itu dicabut, langsung ada iklan lain yang mengisi.
	Double burden	Statements directly identify or imply that a form of tobacco/nicotine consumption can create a double burden to the country. It constitutes the co-occurrence of two negative consequences or impact from a tobacco product(s), or that society is burdened by the existence of two or more types of tobacco products.	This creates a double burden for the government and society, not yet finished dealing with conventional cigarettes, now being hit with electronic cigarettes.	Hal ini membuat beban pemerintah dan masyarakat jadi berganda, belum beres mengurus rokok konvensional sekarang digempur dengan rokok elektronik.
	Impact on the industry	Statements directly identify or imply the impact of tobacco policy on tobacco/nicotine or any other industry income or productivity. This includes the negative or positive impact. Statement that refutes the claim of the negative effects of tobacco policy on the tobacco industry is included.	AMTI is asking the government to guarantee and protect the tobacco industry (IHT) ecosystem through transparent and participatory policy-making. They also request that the government stop the revision process of PP 109/2012, as it will pose a significant threat to the survival of the IHT ecosystem.	AMTI meminta kepada pemerintah untuk menjamin dan melindungi ekosistem IHT melalui penyusunan kebijakan yang transparan serta partisipatif. Mereka juga meminta untuk pemerintah menghentikan proses revisi PP 109/2012, karena akan menjadi ancaman besar bagi keberlangsungan hidup ekosistem IHT.
	Tobacco farmers/workers welfare	Discussion on the impact of tobacco policy/consumption on the livelihood of tobacco farmers/workers including cigarette vendors	"We, as clove farmers, earnestly plead for your help to maintain our livelihoods. Please do not put further pressure on us with the plan to revise PP 109/2012," Dahlan said.	Kami dari petani cengkeh, kami mohon dengan sangat, bantu kami mempertahankan mata pencaharian hidup kami. Jangan semakin ditekan dengan rencana revisi PP 109/2012," sebut Dahlan.
	Impact on consumers	Statements directly identify or imply the impact of tobacco control strategy on tobacco/nicotine consumers, especially those in the low socioeconomic population. This includes the negative or positive impact. Statement that refutes the claim of the negative effects of tobacco policy have on consumers is included. DO NOT CODE for statements specific to individual rights	In addition to not all people have the money to buy a whole pack of cigarettes, the sale of loose cigarettes is usually done in small shops. If such a policy is forced, it is feared to have an impact on the economy of small communities.	Selain tidak semua masyarakat memiliki uang untuk membeli rokok satu pak, penjualan rokok batangan biasanya dilakukan di warung-warung kecil. Bila kebijakan tersebut dipaksakan maka dikhawatirkan berdampak pada ekonomi masyarakat kecil.
	Individual rights	Statements directly identify or imply that tobacco control strategy violates consumer or individual rights to choose, including the freedom to choose the product they'd like to purchase	"This will certainly violate the consumers' right to choose products," said GAPPRI Chairman Henry Najoan in a discussion on brand restrictions held by the Indonesian Employers Association (Apindo)	"Ini tentu akan melanggar hak konsumen untuk memilih produk," kata Ketua GAPPRI Henry Najoan dalam diskusi pembatasan merek yang digelar Asosiasi Pengusaha Indonesia (Apindo)
	Product identity	Discussion on the importance of tobacco product or brand identity, such as specific flavors, packaging, etc. DO NOT CODE for statements specific to the heritage or cultural value of tobacco products	Azami further explained that the use of these additives is crucial for cigarettes, especially since cigarette products in Indonesia have different characteristics and variations, especially kretek. Therefore, the use of additives such as sauce is a differentiating factor between variations and brands.	Azami menjelaskan lebih lanjut penggunaan bahan tambahan ini penting bagi rokok, apalagi produk rokok di Indonesia memiliki karakteristik dan varian yang berbeda, terutama kretek. Jadi penggunaan bahan tambahan seperti saos merupakan pembeda antar varian dan brand.
	Cultural value	Statements directly identify or imply that a tobacco product, such as kretek, is a cultural or heritage product	"If the government revises the additive (article), it will be the end of kretek cigarettes in Indonesia. Kretek cigarettes have a unique Indonesian characteristic that is not found in other countries," said Henry.	"Kalau pemerintah merevisi (pasal) bahan tambahan, itu adalah akhir zaman dari rokok kretek di Indonesia. Rokok kretek berciri khas nusantara dan tidak dimiliki negara lain," kata Henry.
	Product safety	Statements directly identify or imply tobacco/nicotine product safety concerns, including the questioning safety of the product or anticipatory measures to mitigate the risk. DO NOT CODE for statements specific to health consequences of the product use OR that contain harm reduction claim	"If associated with electronic cigarette products that have not been proven safe, then the ban is one form of avoiding consumers from negative effects," said Bigwanto.	"Jika dikaitkan dengan produk rokok elektronik yang belum terbukti aman, maka pelarangan adalah salah satu bentuk menghindarkan konsumen dari akses negatif," kata Bigwanto.

	Harmful health effects	Statements directly identify or imply that tobacco or nicotine product use may cause negative health consequences. DO NOT CODE for arguments indicating link to COVID-19 or if specific to stunting.	He said that the liquid in electronic cigarettes has the potential content that can affect health such as nicotine, nitrosamine which is a carcinogen or a compound that causes cancer, glycerol that can cause respiratory irritation, and metals that cause lung inflammation.	Dia mengatakan bahwa dalam cairan rokok elektrik memiliki potensi kandungan yang berdampak pada kesehatan seperti nikotin, nitrosamin yang merupakan karsinogen atau senyawa penyebab kanker, gliserol yang dapat menyebabkan iritasi saluran napas dan logam penyebab inflamasi paru.
	Beneficial health effects	Statements directly identify or imply that tobacco or nicotine product use may be beneficial to health, including switching over from cigarette smoking. DO NOT CODE for statements claiming reduced harm in comparison to other tobacco product(s)	The second factor after scientific research, Roy mentioned, is the recognition from users regarding their health since using HPTL products.  "Many have testified that they have gained benefits after switching to HPTL and no longer smoke, making their families happy as their homes are no longer filled with smoke or ash. The benefits for users are very positive," he said.	Adapun faktor kedua setelah kajian ilmiah, menurut Roy, adalah pengakuan dari pengguna mengenai kesehatannya sejak menggunakan produk HPTL.  "Banyak yang testimoni memperoleh manfaat setelah pindah ke HPTL dan tidak merokok lagi, bagaimana keluarganya happy rumah nggak bau rokok, nggak ada abu. Manfaatnya bagi pengguna sangat positif," ujarnya.
	Gateway effect	Discussion of how one tobacco/nicotine product use, particularly among nicotine-naïve consumers, may lead to another product/substance use or progress to a higher nicotine dose.	According to Hasbullah, with a smaller dose of nicotine, he is actually worried that IQOS could be a gateway to consuming products with larger doses.	Menurut Hasbullah, dengan dosis nikotin yang lebih kecil, dia justru khawatir IQOS dapat menjadi pintu masuk untuk mengonsumsi produk yang dosisnya lebih besar.
	Harm reduction claim	Statements directly identify or imply that the use of a certain tobacco/nicotine product might have or not have a reduced harm compared to another tobacco/nicotine product, including a statement claiming a safer product relative to the other, smoke-free, tar-free etc	The increasing use of electronic cigarettes is not unrelated to the promotion that has been campaigned for by parties with interests in the framework of health promotion, such as 'smoke-free', 'tar-free', harm reduction, and 'safer'.	meningkatnya penggunaan rokok elektronik tidak lepas dari promosi yang selama ini di kampanyekan baik oleh pihak yang berkepentingan dalam bingkai pro kesehatan seperti 'bebas asap rokok', 'bebas tar', harm reduction, dan 'lebih aman'.
	Product variety	Statements directly identify or imply the presence of a large variety of tobacco/nicotine products in the market	The variety of e-cigarette liquids currently circulating in the market is very diverse, and there is no official data released by the government regarding the quantity and types of e-cigarette liquids in circulation.	Cairan rokok elektronik yang beredar di pasaran saat ini sangat beragam sekali dan belum ada data resmi yang dikeluarkan pemerintah mengenai jumlah dan jenis cairan rokok elektronik yang beredar.
	Illicit drugs	Statements directly identify or imply the presence of illegal drug or substance in tobacco/nicotine products, such as e-cigarettes	BNN (National Narcotics Agency) stated that the types of narcotics mixed in electronic cigarettes include synthetic cannabinoids, which were reported to be the highest during 2015-2017 and become the most commonly mixed substance into electronic cigarettes.	BNN menyebutkan jenis-jenis narkotika yang dicampur dalam rokok elektronik salah satunya adalah synthetic cannabinoids yang dilaporkan tertinggi selama tahun 2015-2017 dan menjadi zat yang paling banyak dicampurkan ke dalam rokok elektronik.
	Product ingredients/substances	Statements directly identify or imply the presence of certain ingredients, substances, or constituents contained in the tobacco/nicotine products. MAY BE DOUBLE CODED with "illicit drugs" or "Harmful health effects" or "Gateway effect"	As long as there is content related to tobacco or nicotine, the policy applied should be the same as that for the cigarette industry.	Selagi ada konten tembakau atau nikotin, kebijakan yang diplakukan harus sama dengan industri rokok.
	Product legality	Discussion of whether a tobacco/nicotine product in the market is legal in Indonesia	Badan POM (National Agency of Drug and Food Control) also considers electronic cigarettes as illegal products because they do not have distribution permits. He was also confused when official vapes were subject to taxes since October 1, 2018.	Badan POM pun menganggap rokok elektrik barang ilegal karena tidak memiliki izin edar. Ia pun bingung ketika vape resmi dikenai cukai sejak 1 Oktober 2018.
	Illicit trade	Discussion of how a policy might affect or result in illegal trade or sales of tobacco/nicotine products	Moreover, Henry Najoan argues that the government does not have a strong legal basis to impose a health warning that covers 90-percent of a cigarette pack. He claims it will not reduce cigarette sales but will rather increase the circulation of illegal cigarettes in the market. (Cigarette Businesses Reject Govt's Massive Health Warning Plan , Pos. 11)	N/A (Article is originally in English)
	Country exemplary	Statement directly identify or imply examples of tobacco control policies or events from other countries or jurisdiction, such as lesson learned from tobacco-related incidence in other countries	Recently, India announced the ban of electronic cigarettes, including import, production, and sales. The Ministry of Health of India, which proposed the ban, said that it is necessary to ensure that electronic cigarettes do not become an epidemic among children and young people.	Baru-baru ini India mengumumkan melarang rokok elektronik yang termasuk larangan impor, produksi dan penjualan. Kementerian Kesehatan India yang mengusulkan larangan tersebut mengatakan bahwa larangan diperlukan untuk memastikan rokok elektronik tidak menjadi epidemi di antara anak-anak dan pemuda.
	Industry-funded foundation	Statements directly identify or imply a foundation or organization that is funded by tobacco-affiliated companies	The 'smoke-free' campaign has suddenly become a global campaign by the tobacco industry to win the hearts of the public, one of which is by establishing the Foundation for Smoke-Free World funded by Philip Morris International.	kampanye 'bebas asap' tiba-tiba menjadi kampanye global industri rokok untuk merebut hati masyarakat salah satunya dengan mendirikan Yayasan untuk Dunia Bebas Asap atau 'Foundation for Smoke-Free World' yang dibiayai oleh Philip Morris Internasional.
	Tobacco industry interference	Discussion of how tobacco or nicotine product industry or front group interferes the tobacco control policymaking and thwarts the implementation of the regulation, including participation in the law-making process, creating anti-smoking campaigns for youth, and green-washing strategy	He also emphasized that in the future, the government or the Ministry of Health should open a discussion with the tobacco industry to produce the right solution for all parties.	Dia juga menegaskan ke depan sebaiknya pemerintah atau Kemenkes membuka pintu diskusi dengan industri rokok atau hasil tembakau untuk menghasilkan solusi yang tepat untuk seluruh pihak.
	Vested/foreign interest	Statement directly identify or imply that tobacco industry OR tobacco control strategy has a conflicting or foreign interest, such as argument that tobacco control measures may violate Indonesia's sovereignty	He also requested that regulations related to the tobacco industry should be free from foreign interests. "Basically, we must preserve our sovereignty, our sovereignty should not be easily eroded, I know there are many interests (in the tobacco industry) but the government must consider all interests," said Hikmahanto.	Ia pun meminta agar regulasi yang berkaitan dengan industri hasil tembakau harus bebas dari kepentingan asing. "Intinya kedaulatan kita harus kita rawat, kedaulatan jangan mudah dikikis, saya tahu banyak kepentingan (di industri hasil tembakau) tapi pemerintah harus memperhatikan semua kepentingan," ungkap Hikmahanto.
	Regulatory drafting process	Discussion of how the amendment process of PP 109/2012 is convened and perceived, such as a claim that it was not inclusive, not transparent, or violate another law.	He said that there were things that were less transparent, especially in the discussion process related to PP 109. Competent parties were never involved in the revision process from the beginning, especially during intensive meetings.	Ia mengatakan ada hal yang kurang transparan terutama dalam proses pembahasan terkait PP 109. Pihak – pihak yang berkompeten justru tidak pernah dilibatkan dalam proses revisi sejak awal, terutama pada saat pertemuan yang sifatnya intensif.
	Science-based	Statements directly identify or imply evidence-based or science-based facts or opinion related to smoking or tobacco control strategy. It includes mention of research methods, results, "sains", etc	"Meanwhile, the influence of cigarettes has been proven, everyone agrees that from the results of, let's say, meta-analysis or statistical reviews, all show that the influence of cigarettes is slow fetal growth. Scientifically, the link between cigarettes and fetal growth has been proven and is very significant," said Hasto.	Sementara pengaruh rokok itu terbukti kan semua sepakat dari hasil katakan lah dari meta analisa atau statistika review itu semua menunjukan bahwa pengaruh rokok adalah janin tumbuh lambat. Secara ilmiah antara rokok dan pertumbuhan janin ini sudah terbukti dan sangat signifikan," ujar Hasto.
	The current regulation is sufficient	Statements directly identify or imply that current regulation is comprehensive, still relevant, and so that amendment is deemed unnecessary or unjustified. This includes preference towards improving the enforcement of the current tobacco policy, or increase the educational campaign instead of revising the regulation.	If the reason for the revision is that the regulations are not running optimally, the focus should be on strengthening efforts to enforce the regulations. Instead of revising them.	Jika memang yang menjadi dalih revisi adalah aturan tidak berjalan maksimal, seharusnya yang didorong adalah penguatan upaya penegakan reguasi. Bukan malah melakukan revisi.
	The current regulation is not sufficient	Statements directly identify or imply that current regulation is not comprehensive, has a loophole, or not effective in addressing the issue at hand, so that the amendment is necessary or justified.	The Chairman of TCSC-IAKMI, Sumarjati Arjoso, said that the current size of pictorial health warnings on cigarette packs is 40 percent, which still provides a larger space for cigarette brands. With a size of only 40 percent, pictorial health warnings are also often covered by excise tape that is attached to cigarette packs.	Ketua TCSC-IAKMI Sumarjati Arjoso mengatakan ukuran peringatan kesehatan bergambar pada bungkus rokok saat ini 40 persen, yang berarti masih memberikan ruang lebih besar untuk merek rokok. Dengan ukuran hanya 40 persen, peringatan kesehatan bergambar juga kerap kali tertutup oleh pita cukai yang ditempel pada bungkus rokok.

	Amended regulation will not be effective	Statements directly identify or imply that the revised PP 109/2012 will not be effective in providing a solution or addressing the issue at hand. DO NOT CODE if it has an argument that the current regulation is sufficient	Even if advertising is banned, underage individuals will still buy cigarettes. As long as enforcement of purchasing regulations has not been carried out, the ban on advertising will not affect the behavior of underage cigarette buyers. In other words, this is actually counterproductive to the original goal, which is to reduce prevalence.	Sekalipun iklan dilarang, mereka yang ada di bawah umur akan tetap membeli rokok. Sepanjang penegakkan terhadap aturan pembelian belum dilakukan, iklan dilarang pun tidak akan mempengaruhi perilaku pembeli rokok di bawah umur. Artinya, hal ini justru kontraproduktif dengan tujuan semula, yakni menurunkan prevalensi.
	Other	Does not fit any argument type category. Must provide description in your own words. For example: COVID-19 that perpetuates the negative impact on the industry or economy (country/individual), Conflicting data/evidence or insufficient evidence or claim is not substantiated, People awareness about the hazard of smoking/nicotine consumption		
<b>Actors:</b> Code for person/group that raised the argument related to PP 109/2012 amendment. Can be cited directly or indirectly in the article	Civil society organizations	Statements directly identify individual from or representative of a civil society group/community expresses their opinion or argument in the article. This included the religious organizations or leaders. For example: Kadin, FSP RTMM SPSI, Komunitas Kretek	"This is where the importance of the state being present to protect public health by creating strong and firm policies to safeguard public health," said the Youth Empowerment Officer of Yayasan Lentera Anak.	"Di sinilah pentingnya negara hadir untuk melindungi kesehatan masyarakat dengan membuat kebijakan yang kuat dan tegas untuk melindungi kesehatan masyarakat," kata Youth Empowerment Officer Yayasan Lentera Anak ini.
	Scholars/experts	Statements directly identify academic, researcher, experts expresses their opinion or argument in the article. DO NOT CODE if it's specific to health professionals or groups	Researcher from Muhammadiyah University, Prof. Dr. Hamka, Mouhamad Bigwanto revealed...	Peneliti dari Universitas Muhammadiyah Prof DR Hamka, Mouhamad Bigwanto mengungkap...
	Health professionals	Statements directly identify health professionals or groups, including doctors, nurse, public health experts, express their opinion or argument in the article	The Chairman of the Indonesian Obstetrics and Gynecology Association (POGI), Prof. Dr. Budi Wiweko, SpOG (K) MPH,	Ketua Perkumpulan Obstetri dan Ginekologi Indonesia (POGI) Prof DR Dr Budi Wiweko SpOG (K) MPH...
	National government	Statements directly identify elected officials, ministries, regulatory agencies, etc. at the national level expresses their opinion or argument in the article	The Coordinating Ministry for Human Development and Culture continues to push for the revision of PP No. 109/2012.	Kemenko PMK terus mendorong upaya revisi PP 109/2012....
	Subnational government	Statements directly identify elected officials, ministries, regulatory agencies, etc. at the subnational level expresses their opinion or argument in the article	The Head of the Health Department of Padang City, Ferimulyani Hamid	Kepala Dinas Kesehatan Kota Padang Ferimulyani Hamid...
	Farmers	Statements directly identify farmers or their representative, primarily tobacco and clove farmers, express their opinion or argument in the article	The Chairman of the Indonesian Clove Farmers Association (APCI), Dahlan Said.	Ketua Umum Asosiasi Petani Cengkeh Indonesia (APCI) Dahlan Said
	Retailers	Statements directly identify workers (individuals or groups) or representative of those who work in tobacco or nicotine product retails/vendors express their opinion or argument in the article	Meanwhile, Rizal (24), the owner of Panah Eastern Tobacco Store, mentioned that the ban on retail cigarette sales has led to competition with illegal cigarettes.	Sementara itu, pemilik Toko Tembakau Panah Eastern, Rizal (24) mengatakan, imbas dari larangan rokok eceran, terjadi persaingan penjualan dengan rokok ilegal.
	E-cigarette consumers	Statements directly identify e-cigarette consumers (individuals or groups) or their representative express their opinion or argument in the article	The Chairman of the Indonesian Personal Vaporizer Association (APVI), Aryo Andrianto	Ketua Asosiasi Personal Vaporizer Indonesia Aryo Andrianto
	People who smoke	Statements directly identify individuals who smoke expresses their opinion or argument in the article. This should be individuals who assumigly independent of any interest group. DO NOT CODE for a representative of a consumer group	Meanwhile, Tigor (39), an active smoker, stated that the plan to ban the sale of middle-strength cigarettes does not significantly affect public health.	Sementara itu, Tigor (39) selaku perokok aktif mengatakan, rencana larangan penjualan rokok ketengan tidak terlalu memengaruhi kesehatan masyarakat.
	Tobacco industry	Statements directly identify the tobacco/nicotine manufacturers, business, producers, company executives, employees, representatives express their opinion or argument in the article. For example: "Industri Hasil Tembakau", "Forum Masyarakat Industri Rokok Indonesia (Formasi)"	In response to this, the association representing IHT, namely the United Association of Indonesian Cigarette Factories (Gappri), the Association of Indonesian White Cigarette Producers (Gaprindo), and the Forum of the Indonesian Cigarette Industry (Formasi)...	Menanggapi hal ini, asosiasi yang mewakili IHT, yaitu Gabungan Perserikatan Pabrik Rokok Indonesia (Gappri), Gabungan Produsen Rokok Putih Indonesia (Gaprindo), dan Forum Masyarakat Industri Rokok Seluruh Indonesia (Formasi)...
	Industry front-groups	Statements directly identify third parties undertake a lobbying or spokesperson role on behalf of tobacco companies, yet they appear to be independent. This includes lobby groups, astroturf, think tanks, and groups/associations that are related with the tobacco/nicotine industry, including tobacco manufacturing labors, tobacco consumer groups. DO NOT CODE if it is specific to a company's affiliate or farmer groups. Use the list of pre-identified tobacco industry front-groups provided in the Tobacco Tactics, 2023	Henry Najoan, the Chairman of the United Association of Indonesian Cigarette Manufacturers (Gappri)	Henry Najoan, Ketua Umum Gabungan Perserikatan Pabrik Rokok Indonesia (Gappri)
	Other	Does not fit any Actor category. Must provide description in your own words. For example: Authors of an article who we cannot identify their affiliation (e.g., Kompasiana) Political party member (e.g., PKB), WHO and any other international organisations, "berbagai kelompok masyarakat", all elements in tobacco supply chain.		



Supplementary 2. Definition and examples of the remaining 15 categories in argument types. The top seven categories are presented in the body text.

Categories	Definition	Example of the categories
Industry's economic/social contribution	The positive impact of tobacco/nicotine industry on the country's economy or social conditions.	"The campaigns driven by both domestic and foreign parties regarding the revision of PP 109/2012, ignore the contribution of the tobacco ecosystem, which has been a support for state revenue through tobacco excise taxes."
The current regulation is not sufficient	The current regulation is not comprehensive, has loopholes, or not effective in addressing the issue at hand, so that the amendment is necessary or justified.	"...the current size of pictorial health warnings on cigarette packs is 40%, which still provides a larger space for cigarette brands. With a size of only 40%, pictorial health warnings are also often covered by tax stamp that is attached to cigarette packs."
Other national/subnational agenda	The amendment might (not) support or compatible with the other Indonesia government's agenda or targets, or vice versa.	"...the National Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMN) 2020-2024, which has a target to decrease the prevalence of child smokers from 9.1 percent in 2018 to 8.7 percent in 2024."
Regulatory drafting process	The way the amendment process of PP 109/2012 is convened and perceived, such as a claim that it was not inclusive, not transparent, or violate another law.	"...there were things that were less transparent, especially in the discussion process related to PP 109. Competent parties were never involved in the revision process from the beginning, especially during intensive meetings. "
TAPS/smoking exposure	Exposure to smoking activities, SHS, or tobacco/nicotine product promotion or sponsorship in the general population, including youth.	"...., it shows that cigarette advertisements that are quite rampant through the internet have a high risk of being accessed or seen by children and adolescents."
Vested/foreign interest	Tobacco industry or tobacco control strategy has a conflicting or foreign interest, such as argument that tobacco control measures reflect a hidden agenda and may violate Indonesia's sovereignty.	"Basically, we must preserve our sovereignty, our sovereignty should not be easily eroded, I know there are many interests (in the tobacco industry) but the government must consider all interests,"
Economic impacts	The negative impact of tobacco control policies or smoking/ e-cigarette use, or the denial of such claim (e.g., not threat to the economy), on the country's economy and society.	"He conveyed that the loss of cigarette advertisements did not significantly affect the revenue of the region. Because, after the cigarette advertisements were removed, there were immediately other advertisements filling in."
Country exemplary	Examples of tobacco control policies or events from other countries or jurisdictions, such as lessons learned from tobacco-related incidence in other countries.	"Recently, India announced the ban of electronic cigarettes, including import, production, and sales..."
COVID-19 Pandemic response/recovery	The PP 109/2012 amendment or tobacco industry's role might contribute to or affect the COVID-19 pandemic response.	"The number of manufacturers may have decreased, but during the pandemic when other industries were laying off workers, the tobacco industry was actually absorbing them. This contribution cannot be denied."
E-cigarette use in the population	E-cigarette use trend and initiation in the population, including youth. This includes statement on number, rate/prevalence, increase or decrease in e-cigarette use, and e-cigarette uptake.	"A simple proof that the electronic cigarette industry targets children and adolescents is the tenfold increase in the use of e-cigarettes among teenagers in just two years,..."

Amended regulation will not be effective	The revised PP 109/2012 will not be effective in providing a solution or addressing the issue at hand.	“As long as enforcement of purchasing regulations has not been carried out, the ban on advertising will not affect the behavior of underage cigarette buyers...”
Accessibility and affordability of tobacco products	Easy access and affordable tobacco/nicotine products to youth and adults. This includes mention of switching to cheaper products.	“...sale of loose cigarettes makes cigarette prices cheaper and more easily accessible for students or children, especially when sold in small shops...”
Illicit trade	The amendment might affect or result in illegal trade or sales of tobacco/nicotine products	“.. the government does not have a strong legal basis to impose a health warning that covers 90% of a cigarette pack. He claims it will not reduce cigarette sales but will rather increase the circulation of illegal cigarettes in the market.”
Tobacco industry interference	Tobacco or nicotine industry or front group interferes the tobacco control policymaking and thwarts the implementation of the regulation.	“In the context of enforcement, PP 109/2012 has been weak so far. The case of the Djarum Badminton Association (PB Djarum), which served as the main sponsor for badminton audition activities for children a few years ago, is evidence that this regulation struggles to address various violations that occur in practice.”
Other	Any other argument, such as discriminatory regulation, product variation in the market	“If this policy ends up benefiting only one party and causing losses to another, that is not called a policy. The principle of finding a middle ground should be prioritised in this matter.”